

# Aboriginal Child Welfare, Self-Government and the Rights of Indigenous Children

Protecting the Vulnerable Under International Law

SONIA HARRIS-SHORT  
*University of Birmingham, UK*

ASHGATE

© Sonia Harris-Short 2012

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without the prior permission of the publisher.

Sonia Harris-Short has asserted her right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act, 1988, to be identified as the author of this work.

Published by  
Ashgate Publishing Limited  
Wey Court East  
Union Road  
Farnham  
Surrey, GU9 7PT  
England

Ashgate Publishing Company  
Suite 420  
101 Cherry Street  
Burlington  
VT 05401-4405  
USA

[www.ashgate.com](http://www.ashgate.com)

### **British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data**

Harris-Short, Sonia.

Aboriginal child welfare, self-government and the rights of indigenous children : protecting the vulnerable under international law.

1. Indigenous children--Legal status, laws, etc.--Australia. 2. Indigenous children--Legal status, laws, etc.--Canada. 3. Child welfare--Australia. 4. Child welfare--Canada. 5. Aboriginal Australians--Politics and government. 6. Indigenous peoples--Canada--Politics and government. 7. Indigenous peoples--Canada--Government relations. 8. Self-determination, National--Canada. 9. Children (International law) 10. Indigenous peoples (International law)

I. Title

341.4'852-dc22

### **Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data**

Harris-Short, Sonia.

Aboriginal child welfare, self-government and the rights of indigenous children : protecting the vulnerable under international law / by Sonia Harris-Short.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-4094-1954-9 (hardback) -- ISBN 978-1-4094-1955-6 (ebook) 1. Indigenous children--Legal status, laws, etc.--Canada. 2. Indigenous children--Legal status, laws, etc.--Australia. I. Title.

K3248.C55H37 2011

344.03'27089--dc23

2011027175

ISBN 9781409419549 (hbk)

ISBN 9781409419556 (ebk)



Printed and bound in Great Britain by  
TJ International Ltd, Padstow, Cornwall.

# Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	<i>ix</i>
<i>Table of Statutes</i>	<i>xiii</i>
<i>Table of International Documents</i>	<i>xv</i>
<i>Preface</i>	<i>xvii</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>xix</i>
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	<i>xxi</i>

## **PART I INTRODUCTION**

1	Introduction	3
	Australia	3
	Canada	8
	Taking Self-Government over Aboriginal Child Welfare Forward: Balancing Rights	15
	Conclusion	18

## **PART II ABORIGINAL CHILD WELFARE IN AUSTRALIA AND CANADA**

2	The Colonization of Aboriginal Children and Families	21
	Introduction	21
	Colonizing Aboriginal Children in Australia: Missions, Dormitories and Residential Schools	24
	Colonizing Aboriginal Children in Canada: The Residential Schools	33
	Initiating a Circle of Abuse: The Legacy of Removals	37
	Entrenching Colonization: The Non-Native Child Welfare System	41
	Aboriginal Child Welfare in the Canadian Courts: Marlee Kline's Critique	57
	Conclusion	67
3	Reforming the Australian and Canadian Child Welfare Systems: Sensitization and Accommodation	69
	Introduction	69
	Australian Reforms to the Non-Native Child Welfare System	70

Canadian Reforms to the Non-Native Child Welfare System	90
Conclusion	118

**PART III SELF-GOVERNMENT OVER ABORIGINAL CHILD WELFARE: LESSONS FROM CANADA**

4	The Promise and the Risks of Aboriginal Self-Government over Aboriginal Child Welfare	123
	Introduction	123
	The Promise of Self-Government	125
	The Risks of Self-Government:	
	The Desjarlais Inquiry and Beyond	128
	Australia: A Challenging Context for Self-Government	145
	Conclusion	147
5	The Right to Self-Government and Protecting the Vulnerable: Balancing Rights under Canadian Constitutional Law	149
	Introduction	149
	Self-Determination, Sovereignty and the Inherent Right to Self-Government	150
	Self-Government in the Courts	154
	Treaty Negotiations	179
	Conclusion	195

**PART IV BROADENING HORIZONS: INDIGENOUS PEOPLES, SELF-DETERMINATION AND PROTECTING CHILDREN'S RIGHTS UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW**

6	Indigenous Peoples, Self-Determination and Self-Government in International Law	201
	Introduction	201
	Indigenous Peoples' Right to Self-Determination under Article 3 of the UN Declaration	206
	Conclusion	241
7	Protecting the Vulnerable within the Framework of Self-Determination	243
	Introduction	243
	Indigenous Peoples and Human Rights	244
	Self-Determination and Human Rights	258
	International Human Rights Law:	
	Culturally Appropriate or Culturally Imperialist?	266
	Conclusion	280

**PART V CONCLUSIONS**

8	Conclusion	285
	<i>Bibliography</i>	293
	<i>Index</i>	311