

# Aboriginal Customary Law: A Source of Common Law Title to Land

Ulla Secher



• H A R T •  
PUBLISHING

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON

2014

Published in the United Kingdom by Hart Publishing Ltd  
16C Worcester Place, Oxford, OX1 2JW  
Telephone: +44 (0)1865 517530  
Fax: +44 (0)1865 510710  
E-mail: [mail@hartpub.co.uk](mailto:mail@hartpub.co.uk)  
Website: <http://www.hartpub.co.uk>

Published in North America (US and Canada) by  
Hart Publishing  
c/o International Specialized Book Services  
920 NE 58th Avenue, Suite 300  
Portland, OR 97213-3786  
USA  
Tel: +1 503 287 3093 or toll-free: (1) 800 944 6190  
Fax: +1 503 280 8832  
E-mail: [orders@isbs.com](mailto:orders@isbs.com)  
Website: <http://www.isbs.com>

© Ulla Secher 2014

Ulla Secher has asserted her right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988,  
to be identified as the author of this work.

Hart Publishing is an imprint of Bloomsbury Publishing plc.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system,  
or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission of Hart Publishing, or as expressly  
permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries  
concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Hart Publishing Ltd  
at the address above.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data  
Data Available

ISBN: 978-1-84946-553-3

Typeset by Hope Services, Abingdon  
Printed and bound in Great Britain by  
TJ International Ltd, Padstow, Cornwall

# Table of Contents

<i>Foreword by Kent McNeil</i>	vii
<i>Preface</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xix
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xxxiii
<b>Introduction</b>	1
<b>Part I: Australian Land Law and the Meaning of Radical Title Pre-Mabo</b>	7
<b>Chapter One: The Origin and Application of the Doctrine of Absolute Crown Ownership in Australia: The Common Law 1788–1992</b>	9
I The Feudal Basis of Land Law in England	9
A Germ of the Doctrine of Tenure	9
i Folkland	10
ii Bookland	11
iii Folkland: Private Property or Public Property?	14
iv Laenland	16
v Summary	17
B The Norman Conquest: Establishment of Feudal Tenure	18
C ‘Exceptions’ to the Doctrine of Tenure	20
i Allodial Land	21
ii Recognition of Customary Law Rights to Land: Tenure in Ancient Demesne	21
iii The Estate <i>Pur Autre Vie</i>	24
iv Adverse Possession	25
v Ecclesiastical Tenures	25
vi Summary	26
II The Reception of Land Law into the Australian Colonies	27
A The English Doctrine of Tenure in 1788	27
B The Doctrine of Reception	28
i <i>Milirrpum v Nabalco Pty Ltd</i> : Non-Feudal Rights in Land	32
III Conclusion	34
<b>Chapter Two: The Meaning of Radical Title Pre-Mabo</b>	36
I The Meaning of Radical Title: The Leading Privy Council Authorities (Re)Examined	39
A <i>St Catherine’s Milling and Lumber Co v R</i>	39
B <i>Amodu Tijani v Secretary, Southern Nigeria</i>	42

C	<i>Re Southern Rhodesia</i>	46
II	International v Municipal Law: American Authority	51
A	<i>Johnson v M'Intosh</i>	52
B	<i>Cherokee Nation v Georgia</i>	55
C	<i>Worcester v Georgia</i>	56
III	New Zealand Authority	59
A	<i>R v Symonds</i>	60
B	<i>Wi Parata v Bishop of Wellington: International Law Revisited</i>	67
C	<i>Nireaha Tamaki v Baker</i>	71
IV	Conclusion	75
 <b>Part II: The Doctrine of Tenure and the Juridical Consequences of the Colonial Law Classification of an 'Inhabited' Colony as 'Settled' Re-examined Post-<i>Mabo</i></b>		<b>79</b>
 <b>Chapter Three: The Doctrine of Tenure and the Common Law Consequences of the Classification of an 'Inhabited' Colony as 'Settled' Post-<i>Mabo</i>: Emergence of the Doctrine of Tenure <i>ad Veritatem</i> and the Doctrine of <i>Continuity Pro-Tempore</i></b>		<b>81</b>
I	Radical Title as the Postulate of the Doctrine of Tenure <i>ad Veritatem</i>	83
A	<i>Mabo</i> : The Decision	83
B	The Feudal Basis of Land Law Revisited	84
C	Summary	94
II	The Reception of Land Law into the Australian Colonies Revisited	96
A	Constitutional Status of Australia: An Inhabited Settled Colony	96
B	The Continuity and Recognition Doctrines Revisited	98
C	Royal Prerogative Powers in the Colonies	111
i	Conquered/Ceded Colonies	111
ii	Inhabited Settled Colonies	121
D	Relevance of Kent McNeil's Original Thesis	132
III	Post- <i>Mabo</i> Developments	135
A	High Court Decisions	135
B	Native Title Legislation	138
IV	Conclusion	139
 <b>Part III: The Meaning of Radical Title in Post-<i>Mabo</i> Australian Jurisprudence</b>		<b>145</b>
 <b>Chapter Four: Radical Title and Unalienated Land Post-<i>Mabo</i></b>		<b>147</b>
I	Automatic Expansion of Radical Title in Respect of Original Unalienated Land: Brennan J's Reliance on the 'No Other Proprietor' Principle (Radical Title as a Concomitant of Sovereignty)	150
A	Beneficial Ownership of Original Unalienated Land? The 'No Other Proprietor' Principle: New Legal Fiction Replacing the Feudal Fiction of Original Crown Ownership – <i>Attorney-General (NSW) v Brown</i> Revisited	150
i	Obiter Comment: Incorrect in Law	151
ii	Crown Not in Fact Proprietor of all Land under Feudal Theory	156

iii	'No Other Proprietor' Principle Contradicts Legal Origins and Purpose of Radical Title	157
II	Automatic Expansion of Radical Title in Respect of Currently Unalienated Land: Brennan J's 'Reversion Expectant' Argument (Radical Title as Both the Postulate of the Doctrine of Tenure and a Concomitant of Sovereignty)	158
A	Beneficial Ownership of Currently Unalienated Land? Common Law Implications of the 'Reversion Expectant' Argument: The Two Limbs of Radical Title and General Principles	160
i	Radical Title as the Postulate of the Doctrine of Tenure: A Bare Legal Title	160
ii	Radical Title as a Concomitant of Sovereignty: No Legal Requirement for a Reversion Expectant to Support a Lease by the Crown	164
iii	Summary	164
B	The High Court, Radical Title and the Reversion Expectant	166
i	<i>Wik</i>	166
ii	Leases in Perpetuity	175
iii	Implications for the Legal Nature of the Crown's Title on the Statutory Grant of a Common Law Lease: Underlying Rationales in <i>Wik</i>	178
III	Extinguishment of Native Title by Crown Grant	180
A	Brennan CJ: Author of Minority Judgment in <i>Wik</i>	180
B	<i>Wik</i> Majority and <i>Ward</i>	182
C	Extinguishment by Freehold Grant: <i>Fejo v Northern Territory</i>	185
D	The Common Law Concept of Partial Extinguishment	186
E	Operational Inconsistency	188
IV	Native Title Legislation: Implications for Property Rights to Currently Unalienated Land	191
V	Conclusion	193
	<b>Chapter Five: Radical Title: Lessons from the Sea</b>	197
I	The Crown's Title to the Territorial Seabed and Beyond: The Position Before <i>Mabo</i>	199
II	The Crown's Title to the Territorial Seabed and Beyond Post- <i>Mabo</i> : <i>WMC</i> and <i>Yarmirr</i> FC	200
A	<i>WMC</i> : Brennan CJ's Judgment – Radical Title versus Statutory Sovereign Rights	200
B	<i>Yarmirr</i> FC: Full Federal Court	203
i	The Majority: Statutory Extension of Radical Title and Selective Operation of the Common Law	203
ii	Merkel J: Common Law Sovereign Rights Equivalent to Radical Title	204
C	<i>WMC</i> : The Other High Court Judges – Common Law Extension of Radical Title to the Territorial Sea	208
III	Summary	210
IV	<i>Yarmirr</i> : The High Court	211
A	Principal Majority Judgment	211

xvi *Table of Contents*

i	Territorial Reach of the Common Law	211
ii	Radical Title versus Common Law Sovereign Rights	212
V	Post- <i>Yarmirr</i> Developments	221
A	The Intertidal Zone	221
i	<i>Gumana v Northern Territory</i>	221
ii	<i>Gumana</i> FC: Two Further Objections to Non-Recognition of Exclusive Native Title Rights to the Sea	222
B	Beyond the Territorial Sea Revisited – the Exclusive Economic Zone and the Continental Shelf: <i>Akiba</i>	223
VI	Conclusion	232
	<b>Part IV: The Practical Implications of the Crown’s Radical Title</b>	<b>237</b>
	<b>Chapter Six: Crown Acquisition of a Plenary Title: The Common Law Record Requirement and Statutory Regimes Regulating the Alienation of Land</b>	<b>239</b>
I	Occupancy as a Basis of Original Crown Ownership	241
A	The Pre- <i>Mabo</i> Position	241
B	The Post- <i>Mabo</i> Position	243
i	Were the Requirements of Occupation Satisfied upon Settlement of Australia?	244
II	The Record Requirement	253
A	Inquest of Office	256
B	Information of Intrusion	261
III	Crown Land Statutes: Statutory Definition of ‘Crown Land’	265
A	Post- <i>Mabo</i> Relationship between ‘Crown Land’ and Radical Title	265
i	Residuary Rights to Crown Land at the Expiration of a Pastoral Lease: <i>Wik</i> Revisited	265
ii	Resumption and Vesting of Crown Land which has Previously been Alienated: <i>Ward</i>	267
iii	Policy of Crown Lands Legislation	270
iv	Pre- <i>Mabo</i> Distinction between ‘Crown Land’ and ‘Property of the Crown’	273
v	Statutory Trespass	273
IV	Legislative Provisions Dealing with the Power to Legislate Regarding Crown Land	280
V	Conclusion	283
	<b>Chapter Seven: The Doctrine of Common Law Aboriginal Customary Title in Australia and Implications for South Africa</b>	<b>286</b>
I	Aboriginal Customary Law: A Source of Non-Derivative Common Law Title to Land	289
II	First Limb of the Doctrine of Common Law Aboriginal Customary Title: Title Arising <i>After</i> Acquisition of Sovereignty	291
A	Incorporeal Rights Proper v Analogous Customary Rights	292

i	Proof of Customary Rights: Local Common Law	296
ii	Public Rights Distinguished	300
iii	Summary	303
B	Application of the First Limb	303
C	Content, Proof and Protection under the First Limb	305
III	Second Limb of the Doctrine of Common Law Aboriginal Customary Title: Title Arising <i>Before</i> Acquisition of Sovereignty	306
A	Aboriginal Customary Title	306
i	Tenure in Ancient Demesne	308
ii	Folkland	309
B	Content of Aboriginal Customary Title	310
i	External Dimension: Folkland Branch	318
ii	External Dimension: Ancient Demesne Branch	319
iii	Internal Dimension	319
C	Proof of Aboriginal Customary Title	320
i	Test for Proof	320
ii	Specific Presumptions and Rules Relating to Proof	322
iii	Summary	329
D	Protection of Aboriginal Customary Title	330
IV	Doctrinal Underpinnings for Aboriginal Customary Title	334
V	Aboriginal Customary Law as a Source of Non-Derivative Common Law Title to Land in Ceded and Conquered Colonies: South Africa <i>Post-Richtersveld</i>	335
A	South Africa's Bipartite Colonial History	337
B	The South African Experience: <i>Richtersveld</i>	338
i	Supreme Court of Appeal	340
ii	Constitutional Court	343
C	The Doctrine of <i>Continuity Pro-Tempore</i> in Bipartite Colonial Contexts	347
D	The First Limb in South Africa	352
VI	Conclusion	353
 Chapter Eight: Canada: Application and Implications of the Doctrine of Common Law Aboriginal Customary Title		 358
I	The Reception of Law in Canada: the Constitutional Status of the Canadian Provinces and Territories Reconsidered	360
A	Reception of Land Law in the Canadian Provinces and Territories	360
B	Summary	365
II	The Doctrine of Tenure, Radical Title and Aboriginal Land Rights in Canada	367
A	Pre- <i>Calder</i> Aboriginal Title Jurisprudence	368
B	<i>Calder</i> and pre- <i>Delgamuukw</i> Aboriginal Title Jurisprudence	369
C	Summary: the Canadian Jurisprudence pre- <i>Delgamuukw</i>	388
D	<i>Delgamuukw</i> and Beyond	393
i	<i>Delgamuukw</i>	393
ii	<i>Marshall/Bernard</i>	410

xviii *Table of Contents*

iii <i>Tsilhqot'in Nation</i>	424
iv <i>William v British Columbia</i>	426
III Bipartite Colonial Contexts – Quebec and Aboriginal Title	432
IV Conclusion	435
<b>Conclusions</b>	442
<i>Bibliography</i>	457
<i>Index</i>	481