

# Aboriginal Legal Issues Cases, Materials & Commentary Third Edition

John J. Borrows, FRSC  
B.A., M.A., J.D., LL.M., Ph.D.  
of the Ojibway / Anishinabe First Nation  
Professor  
Faculty of Law, University of Victoria

Leonard I. Rotman  
B.A., LL.B., LL.M., S.J.D.  
of the Ontario Bar  
Professor  
Faculty of Law, University of Windsor



LexisNexis®

**Aboriginal Legal Issues: Cases, Materials & Commentary, 3rd edition**

© LexisNexis Canada Inc. 2007

August 2007

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in any material form (including photocopying or storing it in any medium by electronic means and whether or not transiently or incidentally to some other use of this publication) without the written permission of the copyright holder except in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright Act. Applications for the copyright holder's written permission to reproduce any part of this publication should be addressed to the publisher.

Warning: The doing of an unauthorized act in relation to a copyrighted work may result in both a civil claim for damages and criminal prosecution.

**Members of the LexisNexis Group worldwide**

|                       |                                                                                                    |
|-----------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Canada</b>         | LexisNexis Canada Inc, 123 Commerce Valley Drive East, MARKHAM, Ontario                            |
| <b>Argentina</b>      | Abeledo Perrot, Jurisprudencia Argentina and Depalma, BUENOS AIRES                                 |
| <b>Australia</b>      | Butterworths, a Division of Reed International Books Australia Pty Ltd, CHATSWOOD, New South Wales |
| <b>Austria</b>        | ARD Betriebsdienst and Verlag Orac, VIENNA                                                         |
| <b>Chile</b>          | Publitecsa and Conosur Ltda, SANTIAGO DE CHILE                                                     |
| <b>Czech Republic</b> | Orac sro, PRAGUE                                                                                   |
| <b>France</b>         | Éditions du Juris-Classeur SA, PARIS                                                               |
| <b>Hong Kong</b>      | Butterworths Asia (Hong Kong), HONG KONG                                                           |
| <b>Hungary</b>        | Hvg Orac, BUDAPEST                                                                                 |
| <b>India</b>          | Butterworths India, NEW DELHI                                                                      |
| <b>Ireland</b>        | Butterworths (Ireland) Ltd, DUBLIN                                                                 |
| <b>Italy</b>          | Giuffré, MILAN                                                                                     |
| <b>Malaysia</b>       | Malayan Law Journal Sdn Bhd, KUALA LUMPUR                                                          |
| <b>New Zealand</b>    | Butterworths of New Zealand, WELLINGTON                                                            |
| <b>Poland</b>         | Wydawnictwa Prawnicze PWN, WARSAW                                                                  |
| <b>Singapore</b>      | Butterworths Asia, SINGAPORE                                                                       |
| <b>South Africa</b>   | Butterworth Publishers (Pty) Ltd, DURBAN                                                           |
| <b>Switzerland</b>    | Stämpfli Verlag AG, BERNE                                                                          |
| <b>United Kingdom</b> | Butterworths Tolley, a Division of Reed Elsevier (UK), LONDON, WC2A                                |
| <b>USA</b>            | LexisNexis, DAYTON, Ohio                                                                           |

**Library and Archives Canada Cataloguing in Publication**

Borrows, John, 1963-

Aboriginal legal issues : cases, materials & commentary / John J. Borrows, Leonard I. Rotman. — 3rd ed.

Includes index.

ISBN 978-0-433-45328-4

1. Native peoples—Legal status, laws, etc.—Canada—Cases. I. Rotman, Leonard Ian II. Title.

KE7709.B67 2007

342.7108'72

C2007-903706-2

KF8205.B67 2007

Printed and bound in Canada.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

|                                |     |
|--------------------------------|-----|
| <i>Preface</i> .....           | v   |
| <i>About the Authors</i> ..... | vii |
| <i>Acknowledgements</i> .....  | ix  |
| <i>Table of Cases</i> .....    | xxv |

## Chapter 1: Governance

|                                                                                                                                |    |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| A. Introduction.....                                                                                                           | 1  |
| B. Aboriginal Views on Governance .....                                                                                        | 1  |
| <i>Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples:</i><br><i>Restructuring the Relationship, Vol. 2</i> .....            | 1  |
| C. The Court's View on Aboriginal Governance .....                                                                             | 8  |
| <i>R. v. Sioui</i> .....                                                                                                       | 9  |
| D. The Historical Recognition of Aboriginal Governance.....                                                                    | 12 |
| Leonard I. Rotman, <i>Fiduciary Law</i> .....                                                                                  | 12 |
| 1. The <i>Treaty of Albany</i> .....                                                                                           | 14 |
| Articles between Col. Cartwright and the New<br>York Indians, 24 September 1664 .....                                          | 14 |
| 2. The Covenant Chain .....                                                                                                    | 16 |
| Leonard I. Rotman, "Taking Aim at the Canons of<br>Treaty Interpretation in Canadian Aboriginal<br>Rights Jurisprudence" ..... | 17 |
| 3. The <i>Royal Proclamation of 1763</i> .....                                                                                 | 19 |
| Royal Proclamation of 7 October, 1763.....                                                                                     | 20 |
| Leonard I. Rotman, <i>Fiduciary Law</i> .....                                                                                  | 22 |
| John Borrows, "Wampum at Niagara: The Royal<br>Proclamation, Canadian Legal History and<br>Self-Government" .....              | 24 |
| <i>Chippewas of Sarnia Band v. Canada (Attorney<br/>        General)</i> .....                                                 | 28 |
| <i>Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal<br/>        Peoples: Restructuring the Relationship, Vol. 2</i> .....          | 32 |
| E. The <i>Indian Act's</i> Challenge to Aboriginal Governance.....                                                             | 36 |
| 1. Haudenosaunee Governance and the Great Law:<br>Before the <i>Indian Act</i> .....                                           | 36 |
| 2. Challenges to Haudenosaunee Governance:<br>Introducing the <i>Indian Act</i> .....                                          | 39 |
| <i>Logan v. Styres</i> .....                                                                                                   | 40 |
| "The Last Speech of Des-ka-heh" .....                                                                                          | 45 |
| 3. The <i>Indian Act</i> and the General Challenge to<br>Aboriginal Governance.....                                            | 48 |
| 4. Supplementing the <i>Indian Act</i> ? .....                                                                                 | 52 |
| (a) Leadership Selection Codes .....                                                                                           | 52 |
| (b) Administration of Government Codes .....                                                                                   | 53 |

|                                                                                                                                                                                                 |    |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| (c) Financial Management and Accountability                                                                                                                                                     |    |
| Codes .....                                                                                                                                                                                     | 53 |
| F. Contemporary Cases: Litigating Governance.....                                                                                                                                               | 56 |
| <i>R. v. Pamajewon</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                    | 57 |
| Gisday Wa and Delgam Uukw, The Spirit in the Land:<br>The Opening Statement of the Gitksan and<br>Wet'suwet'en Hereditary Chiefs in the Supreme<br>Court of British Columbia May 11, 1987 ..... | 60 |
| <i>Delgamuukw v. British Columbia</i> .....                                                                                                                                                     | 62 |
| G. Negotiating Governance Agreements .....                                                                                                                                                      | 65 |
| 1. Nisga'a Law and the Nisga'a Agreement .....                                                                                                                                                  | 66 |
| <i>John Borrows, Indigenous Legal Traditions</i> .....                                                                                                                                          | 66 |
| Chief Gosnell's Historic Speech to the British<br>Columbia Legislature .....                                                                                                                    | 71 |
| Douglas Sanders, "We Intend to Live Here Forever:<br>A Primer on the Nisga'a Treaty" .....                                                                                                      | 76 |
| <i>Campbell v. British Columbia (Attorney General)</i> .....                                                                                                                                    | 78 |
| H. Conclusion.....                                                                                                                                                                              | 89 |

## Chapter 2: Aboriginal Rights

|                                                                                                                               |     |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| A. Introduction.....                                                                                                          | 93  |
| B. Aboriginal Peoples, Canada and the Constitution.....                                                                       | 94  |
| 1. Canadian Constitutional Sources .....                                                                                      | 94  |
| 2. Constitutional Suspicions.....                                                                                             | 94  |
| 3. Constitutional Discussions.....                                                                                            | 95  |
| 4. Constitutional Amendment: Strategies and Debates.....                                                                      | 96  |
| 5. Constitutional Entrenchment.....                                                                                           | 98  |
| 6. The Future .....                                                                                                           | 99  |
| C. The Characterization of Aboriginal Rights by the Courts.....                                                               | 99  |
| <i>R. v. Sparrow</i> .....                                                                                                    | 101 |
| D. Aboriginal Rights: Inherent or Contingent Rights? .....                                                                    | 115 |
| Michael Asch and Patrick Macklem, "Aboriginal<br>Rights and Canadian Sovereignty: An Essay on<br><i>R. v. Sparrow</i> " ..... | 115 |
| E. Post-Sparrow Considerations of Aboriginal Rights .....                                                                     | 120 |
| <i>R. v. Van der Peet</i> .....                                                                                               | 120 |
| <i>R. v. Gladstone</i> .....                                                                                                  | 143 |
| <i>Delgamuukw v. British Columbia</i> .....                                                                                   | 149 |
| <i>R. v. Adams</i> .....                                                                                                      | 154 |
| <i>R. v. Côté</i> .....                                                                                                       | 159 |
| <i>Mitchell v. M.N.R.</i> .....                                                                                               | 165 |
| <i>R. v. Sappier; R. v. Gray</i> .....                                                                                        | 167 |
| F. Conclusion.....                                                                                                            | 182 |

## Chapter 3: Aboriginal Title

|                      |     |
|----------------------|-----|
| A. Introduction..... | 185 |
|----------------------|-----|

|    |                                                               |     |
|----|---------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| B. | The Importance of Land to Aboriginal Cultures.....            | 185 |
|    | <i>The Justice System and Aboriginal People:</i>              |     |
|    | <i>Report of the Aboriginal Justice Inquiry</i>               |     |
|    | <i>of Manitoba, Vol. 1</i> .....                              | 186 |
|    | Chief John Snow, <i>These Mountains Are Our Sacred</i>        |     |
|    | <i>Places: The Story of the Stoney Indians</i> .....          | 187 |
|    | John Borrows, <i>Living Law on a Living Earth</i> .....       | 188 |
| C. | The Doctrine of Aboriginal Title.....                         | 193 |
| 1. | Aboriginal Title and the Law of Nations.....                  | 194 |
|    | <i>The Justice System and Aboriginal People:</i>              |     |
|    | <i>Report of the Aboriginal Justice Inquiry of</i>            |     |
|    | <i>Manitoba, Vol. 1</i> .....                                 | 194 |
| 2. | The Use of Symbolic Acts.....                                 | 200 |
| 3. | The Doctrine of Discovery and Early Aboriginal                |     |
|    | Rights Jurisprudence.....                                     | 202 |
|    | <i>Worcester v. State of Georgia</i> .....                    | 203 |
| D. | The British Crown's Response .....                            | 209 |
|    | <i>Opetchesaht Indian Band v. Canada</i> .....                | 211 |
| E. | Early Canadian Aboriginal Title Jurisprudence.....            | 214 |
|    | <i>St. Catherine's Milling &amp; Lumber Co. v. R.</i> .....   | 214 |
|    | <i>Calder v. British Columbia (Attorney General)</i> .....    | 221 |
| F. | The Beginnings of Modern Canadian Aboriginal Title            |     |
|    | Jurisprudence .....                                           | 241 |
|    | <i>Baker Lake (Hamlet) v. Canada (Minister of Indian</i>      |     |
|    | <i>Affairs and Northern Development)</i> .....                | 242 |
|    | <i>Guerin v. R.</i> .....                                     | 244 |
| G. | More Recent Judicial Considerations of Aboriginal Title ..... | 248 |
|    | <i>Delgamuukw v. British Columbia</i> .....                   | 249 |
|    | Kent McNeil, "The Onus of Proof of Aboriginal Title" ..       | 264 |
|    | <i>R. v. Marshall; R. v. Bernard</i> .....                    | 267 |
| H. | Alternative to Aboriginal Title Litigation.....               | 287 |
|    | <i>Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal</i>           |     |
|    | <i>Peoples: Restructuring the Relationship, Vol. 2</i> .....  | 287 |
| I. | Conclusion.....                                               | 293 |

#### Chapter 4: Treaties

|    |                                                              |     |
|----|--------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| A. | Introduction.....                                            | 295 |
|    | <i>Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal</i>          |     |
|    | <i>Peoples: Looking Forward, Looking Back, Vol. 1</i> .....  | 295 |
| B. | The Process of Treaty-Making .....                           | 298 |
| C. | The Changing Face of Treaties.....                           | 299 |
|    | D.N. Sprague, "Canada's Treaties with Aboriginal             |     |
|    | Peoples" .....                                               | 300 |
| D. | Conceptualizing Crown-Native Treaties.....                   | 302 |
|    | <i>Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples:</i> |     |
|    | <i>Looking Forward, Looking Back, Vol. 1</i> .....           | 302 |
|    | <i>R. v. Syliboy</i> .....                                   | 304 |

|                                                                                                                                                                                                      |     |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| William Wicken, "The Mi'kmaq and Wuastukwiuk Treaties" .....                                                                                                                                         | 310 |
| Alexander Morris, <i>The Treaties with the Indians of Manitoba and the North-West Territories, Including the Negotiations on Which They Were Based, and Other Information Relating Thereto</i> ..... | 315 |
| Treaty No. 3.....                                                                                                                                                                                    | 321 |
| <i>Paulette v. Registrar of Titles</i> (No. 2) .....                                                                                                                                                 | 327 |
| Patrick Macklem, "First Nations Self-Government and the Borders of the Canadian Legal Imagination" ....                                                                                              | 333 |
| E. Modern Canadian Treaty Jurisprudence — Beginning a New Process of Interpretation .....                                                                                                            | 334 |
| <i>R. v. White and Bob</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                     | 334 |
| <i>Simon v. R.</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                             | 341 |
| F. More Recent Judicial Considerations of Treaties .....                                                                                                                                             | 353 |
| <i>Sioui v. Quebec (Attorney General)</i> .....                                                                                                                                                      | 354 |
| <i>R. v. Badger</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                            | 378 |
| <i>R. v. Sundown</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                           | 385 |
| G. Treaties, Treaty Interpretations, and the "Honour of the Crown" .....                                                                                                                             | 392 |
| <i>R. v. Marshall</i> ("Marshall No. 1") .....                                                                                                                                                       | 392 |
| <i>R. v. Marshall; R. v. Bernard</i> .....                                                                                                                                                           | 406 |
| H. Treaties and Federalism.....                                                                                                                                                                      | 413 |
| <i>R. v. Morris</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                            | 415 |
| I. Conclusion.....                                                                                                                                                                                   | 429 |
| John Borrows, "Ground Rules: Indigenous Treaties and Legal Foundations" .....                                                                                                                        | 430 |

## Chapter 5: Crown Obligations

|                                                                                                                |     |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| A. Introduction.....                                                                                           | 435 |
| John Borrows, <i>Let Obligations Be Done</i> .....                                                             | 436 |
| B. The Honour of the Crown .....                                                                               | 439 |
| C. Fiduciary Law .....                                                                                         | 441 |
| Leonard I. Rotman: <i>Parallel Paths: Fiduciary Doctrine and the Crown-Native Relationship in Canada</i> ..... | 442 |
| 1. The Implications of Fiduciary Law .....                                                                     | 447 |
| Leonard I. Rotman: "Fiduciary Doctrine: A Concept in Need of Understanding" .....                              | 447 |
| 2. Fiduciary Law versus Trust Law.....                                                                         | 456 |
| <i>Pawis v. Canada</i> .....                                                                                   | 456 |
| 3. The Triumph of Fiduciary Law over Trust Law .....                                                           | 458 |
| <i>Guerin v. R.</i> .....                                                                                      | 458 |
| 4. The Scope of the Crown's Fiduciary Obligations.....                                                         | 468 |
| <i>R. v. Sparrow</i> .....                                                                                     | 469 |
| 5. The Crown's Fiduciary Obligations and Conflict of Interest .....                                            | 470 |
| <i>Osoyoos Indian Band v. Oliver (Town)</i> .....                                                              | 471 |

|    |                                                                                                                                |     |
|----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
|    | <i>Wewaykum Indian Band v. Canada</i> .....                                                                                    | 478 |
| 6. | To Whom Do the Crown's Fiduciary Obligations<br>Belong? .....                                                                  | 493 |
|    | (a) The Provincial Crowns' Fiduciary Obligations .....                                                                         | 493 |
|    | Leonard I. Rotman: <i>Parallel Paths: Fiduciary<br/>    Doctrine and the Crown-Native Relationship<br/>    in Canada</i> ..... | 493 |
|    | Leonard I. Rotman, <i>Fiduciary Law</i> .....                                                                                  | 496 |
|    | (b) The British Crown's Obligations .....                                                                                      | 499 |
| 7. | Equitable and Statutory Bars to Breach of Fiduciary<br>Duty Claims .....                                                       | 500 |
|    | <i>Wewaykum Indian Band v. Canada</i> .....                                                                                    | 501 |
|    | Leonard I. Rotman, <i>Parallel Paths: Fiduciary<br/>    Doctrine and the Crown-Native Relationship<br/>    in Canada</i> ..... | 505 |
| D. | The Duty to Consult .....                                                                                                      | 506 |
|    | <i>Haida Nation v. British Columbia (Minister of Forests)</i> .....                                                            | 506 |
|    | <i>Taku River Tlingit First Nation v. British Columbia<br/>    (Project Assessment Director)</i> .....                         | 519 |
|    | <i>Mikisew Cree First Nation v. Canada (Minister<br/>    of Canadian Heritage)</i> .....                                       | 526 |
| E. | Conclusion .....                                                                                                               | 541 |

## Chapter 6: Inuit Rights

|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |     |
|----|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| A. | Introduction .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | 545 |
| B. | Inuit Background .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | 545 |
|    | Mariano Aupilaarjuk, Marie Tulimaaq, Emile<br>Imaruittuq, Lucassie Nutaraaluk, Akisu Joamie,<br><i>Interviewing Inuit Elders, Volume 2: Perspectives on Traditional<br/>    Law</i> , Jarich Oosten, Frédéric Laugrand<br>and Wim Rasing, eds. .... | 545 |
|    | <i>Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal<br/>    Peoples: Looking Forward, Looking Back, Vol. 1</i> .....                                                                                                                                    | 547 |
| C. | Inuit as "Indians" under Section 91(24) of the<br><i>Constitution Act, 1867</i> .....                                                                                                                                                               | 548 |
|    | <i>Reference re Term "Indians"</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                                                            | 548 |
| D. | Inuit Land Claims and Self-Government Agreements .....                                                                                                                                                                                              | 555 |
|    | <i>Inuit Land Claims — A Chronology</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                                                       | 556 |
| E. | Inuit Traditional Law and the Creation of an Inuit-<br>focused Jurisprudence .....                                                                                                                                                                  | 558 |
|    | Mariano Aupilaarjuk, Marie Tulimaaq, Emile<br>Imaruittuq, Lucassie Nutaraaluk, Akisu Joamie,<br><i>Interviewing Inuit Elders, Volume 2: Perspectives on Traditional<br/>    Law</i> , Jarich Oosten, Frédéric Laugrand<br>and Wim Rasing, eds. .... | 561 |
|    | <i>Kadlak v. Nunavut (Minister of Sustainable<br/>    Development)</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                        | 563 |

|                                                                                                                                                                    |     |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| <i>Nunavut Tunngavik Inc. v. Canada (Attorney General)</i> .....                                                                                                   | 570 |
| Thomas Berger, <i>Conciliator's Final Report: Nunavut Land Claims Agreement Implementation Planning Contract Negotiations for the Second Planning Period</i> ..... | 580 |
| F. Conclusion .....                                                                                                                                                | 583 |

## Chapter 7: Métis Rights

|                                                                                                                     |     |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| A. Introduction.....                                                                                                | 585 |
| B. Métis Identity .....                                                                                             | 585 |
| <i>Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples: Perspectives and Realities, Vol. 4</i> .....               | 585 |
| Larry Chartrand, "Metis Identity and Citizenship" .....                                                             | 587 |
| <i>Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples: Perspectives and Realities, Vol. 4</i> .....               | 590 |
| <i>R. v. Blais</i> .....                                                                                            | 593 |
| C. Métis Land Rights.....                                                                                           | 600 |
| <i>Dumont v. Canada (Attorney General)</i> .....                                                                    | 601 |
| Clem Chartier, "Aboriginal Rights and Land Issues: The Metis Perspective" .....                                     | 608 |
| <i>The Justice System and Aboriginal People: Report of the Aboriginal Justice Inquiry of Manitoba, Vol. 1</i> ..... | 611 |
| D. Métis Aboriginal Rights.....                                                                                     | 612 |
| <i>R. v. Van der Peet</i> .....                                                                                     | 612 |
| <i>R. v. Powley</i> .....                                                                                           | 614 |
| E. Conclusion.....                                                                                                  | 626 |

## Chapter 8: Federalism/Constitutional Issues

|                                                                                                                                       |     |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| A. Introduction.....                                                                                                                  | 629 |
| B. The Implications of the Division of Powers on Aboriginal Peoples .....                                                             | 631 |
| Leonard I. Rotman, "Provincial Fiduciary Obligations to First Nations: The Nexus Between Governmental Power and Responsibility" ..... | 631 |
| <i>Cardinal v. Alberta (Attorney General)</i> .....                                                                                   | 636 |
| C. Section 88 of the <i>Indian Act</i> .....                                                                                          | 647 |
| <i>Dick v. R.</i> .....                                                                                                               | 648 |
| Kerry Wilkins, "Still Crazy After All These Years: Section 88 of the <i>Indian Act</i> at Fifty" .....                                | 656 |
| <i>Delgamuukw v. British Columbia</i> .....                                                                                           | 668 |
| <i>Kitkatla Band v. British Columbia (Minister of Small Business, Tourism and Culture)</i> .....                                      | 671 |
| <i>R. v. Morris</i> .....                                                                                                             | 683 |
| D. Abrogating or Derogating from Aboriginal and Treaty Rights .....                                                                   | 688 |

|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                 |     |
|----|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
|    | <i>R. v. Sikyea</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                       | 688 |
|    | <i>R. v. Horseman</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                     | 695 |
|    | <i>R. v. Badger</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                       | 708 |
| E. | The Charter and Aboriginal Peoples .....                                                                                                                                                        | 715 |
|    | <i>Lovelace v. Ontario</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                | 715 |
| F. | Constitutional Amendment and Aboriginal Peoples .....                                                                                                                                           | 719 |
|    | Draft Legal Text of Charlottetown Accord .....                                                                                                                                                  | 719 |
| G. | Conclusion.....                                                                                                                                                                                 | 726 |
|    | Noel Lyon, "A Perspective on the Application<br>of the <i>Criminal Code</i> to Aboriginal Peoples in Light<br>of the Judgment of the Supreme Court of Canada<br>in <i>R. v. Sparrow</i> " ..... | 727 |

## Chapter 9: Aboriginal Women

|    |                                                                                                                                                    |     |
|----|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| A. | Introduction.....                                                                                                                                  | 731 |
|    | "Aboriginal Women" .....                                                                                                                           | 731 |
|    | <i>Stolen Sisters: Discrimination and Violence<br/>Against Indigenous Women in Canada: A Summary<br/>of Amnesty International's Concerns</i> ..... | 740 |
|    | Aboriginal Women: A Profile from the 2001 Census .....                                                                                             | 744 |
| B. | Matrimonial Property .....                                                                                                                         | 745 |
|    | <i>Derrickson v. Derrickson</i> .....                                                                                                              | 746 |
|    | Mary-Ellen Turpel, "Home/Land" .....                                                                                                               | 752 |
| C. | Denial of Status under the <i>Indian Act</i> .....                                                                                                 | 759 |
|    | <i>Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal<br/>Peoples: Perspectives and Realities, Vol. 4</i> .....                                          | 760 |
|    | <i>Canada (Attorney General) v. Lavell</i> .....                                                                                                   | 766 |
|    | <i>Lovelace v. Canada</i> .....                                                                                                                    | 776 |
|    | "Retrospective", Enough is Enough: Aboriginal<br>Women Speak Out .....                                                                             | 781 |
| D. | Amendments to the <i>Indian Act</i> : Bill C-31 and Its Effects.....                                                                               | 785 |
|    | <i>Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal<br/>Peoples: Perspectives and Realities, Vol. 4</i> .....                                          | 785 |
|    | <i>Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal<br/>Peoples: Perspectives and Realities, Vol. 4</i> .....                                          | 787 |
|    | <i>Sawridge Band v. Canada (T.D.)</i> .....                                                                                                        | 789 |
|    | <i>Sawridge Band v. Canada</i> (1997) .....                                                                                                        | 799 |
|    | <i>Sawridge Band v. Canada</i> (2006) .....                                                                                                        | 802 |
|    | <i>Corbiere v. Canada (Minister of Indian and<br/>Northern Affairs)</i> .....                                                                      | 804 |
| E. | Aboriginal Women's Organizations .....                                                                                                             | 810 |
|    | <i>Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal<br/>Peoples: Perspectives and Realities, Vol. 4</i> .....                                          | 810 |
|    | <i>Native Women's Assn. of Canada v. Canada</i> .....                                                                                              | 813 |
| F. | Conclusion.....                                                                                                                                    | 823 |

**Chapter 10: Child Welfare**

|    |                                                                                                                                      |     |
|----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| A. | Introduction.....                                                                                                                    | 825 |
|    | <i>Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples: Gathering Strength, Vol. 3</i> .....                                        | 825 |
| B. | Historical Treatment .....                                                                                                           | 826 |
|    | "Child Welfare" .....                                                                                                                | 826 |
| C. | Contemporary Realities .....                                                                                                         | 836 |
| D. | Best Interests of the Child.....                                                                                                     | 839 |
|    | 1. Best Interests of the Child and Judicial Interpretation ...                                                                       | 839 |
|    | <i>Racine v. Woods</i> .....                                                                                                         | 839 |
|    | 2. Best Interests of the Child and Bi-Cultural Descent .....                                                                         | 851 |
|    | <i>H. (D.) v. M. (H.)</i> .....                                                                                                      | 851 |
|    | <i>Pine Tree Legal Assistance, Wabanaki Legal News</i> ....                                                                          | 853 |
|    | Adoptive Family Wins Custody of Native Boy:<br>Supreme Court Will Not Deliver Written Reasons<br>for Ruling.....                     | 853 |
|    | <i>S. (K.J.) v. T. (M.)</i> .....                                                                                                    | 855 |
| E. | Self-Government Initiatives .....                                                                                                    | 865 |
|    | <i>S. (E.G.) v. Spallumcheen Band Council</i> .....                                                                                  | 865 |
|    | <i>Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples: Gathering Strength, Vol. 3</i> .....                                        | 872 |
|    | Sonia Harris-Short, "The Road Back from Hell? Self-Government and the Decolonisation of<br>Aboriginal Child Welfare in Canada" ..... | 876 |
|    | "Child Welfare" .....                                                                                                                | 880 |
| F. | Challenges of Aboriginal Control.....                                                                                                | 881 |
|    | <i>Wen'de: We Are Coming to the Light of Day</i> .....                                                                               | 882 |
|    | <i>Jane Doe (Public Trustee of) v. Awasis Agency of Northern Manitoba</i> .....                                                      | 884 |
|    | <i>Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples: Gathering Strength, Vol. 3</i> .....                                        | 887 |
| G. | Customary Child and Family Relations .....                                                                                           | 888 |
|    | <i>Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples: Gathering Strength, Vol. 3</i> .....                                        | 888 |
|    | <i>Casimel v. Insurance Corp. of British Columbia</i> .....                                                                          | 890 |
| H. | Conclusion.....                                                                                                                      | 899 |

**Chapter 11: Taxation**

|    |                                                                           |     |
|----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| A. | Introduction.....                                                         | 901 |
| B. | History and Context.....                                                  | 901 |
| C. | Sovereignty and the Customs and Excise Tax.....                           | 903 |
|    | <i>Francis v. Canada</i> .....                                            | 904 |
|    | <i>Mitchell v. M.N.R.</i> .....                                           | 906 |
| D. | Personal Income Tax .....                                                 | 919 |
|    | Richard Bartlett, <i>Indians and Taxation in Canada</i> ,<br>3rd ed. .... | 919 |

|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |     |
|----|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
|    | <i>R. v. Nowegijick</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | 923 |
|    | <i>Mitchell v. Peguis Indian Band</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                                                     | 926 |
|    | <i>Williams v. Canada</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 935 |
|    | <i>Folster v. Canada</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | 944 |
|    | <i>Recalma v. Canada</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | 947 |
|    | <i>McDiarmid Lumber Ltd. v. God's Lake First Nation</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                                   | 955 |
| E. | Sales Tax .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 964 |
|    | <i>Union of New Brunswick Indians v. New Brunswick (Minister of Finance)</i> .....                                                                                                                                                              | 964 |
|    | Andre LeDressay, "A Brief Tax (on a me) of First Nations Taxation and Economic Development" in <i>Sharing the Harvest: The Road to Self Reliance, Report of the National Round Table on Aboriginal Economic Development and Resources</i> ..... | 972 |
| F. | Aboriginal Taxation Powers .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                | 976 |
|    | <i>Report of the Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples: Restructuring the Relationship, Vol. 2</i> .....                                                                                                                                       | 976 |
|    | 1. Inherent Aboriginal Taxation Powers .....                                                                                                                                                                                                    | 977 |
|    | 2. <i>Indian Act Band Taxation</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                                                        | 978 |
|    | 3. Negotiated Aboriginal Taxation Powers.....                                                                                                                                                                                                   | 982 |
| G. | Conclusion.....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 984 |

## Chapter 12: Aboriginal Peoples and Criminal Justice

|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                |     |
|----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| A. | Introduction.....                                                                                                                                                                              | 987 |
| B. | The Failure of Criminal Law for Aboriginal Peoples .....                                                                                                                                       | 988 |
|    | 1. Historical Realities.....                                                                                                                                                                   | 988 |
|    | <i>The Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, Bridging the Cultural Divide: A Report on Aboriginal People and Criminal Justice in Canada</i> .....                                            | 988 |
|    | <i>Report of the Cariboo-Chilcotin Justice Inquiry (British Columbia)</i> .....                                                                                                                | 989 |
|    | <i>Report of the Osnaburgh/Windigo Tribal Justice Review Committee</i> .....                                                                                                                   | 990 |
|    | 2. Contemporary Realities.....                                                                                                                                                                 | 990 |
|    | (a) Donald Marshall Jr. ....                                                                                                                                                                   | 990 |
|    | Excerpts from Summary of Findings of the Royal Commission on the Donald Marshall, Jr. Prosecution, Nova Scotia Judgments.....                                                                  | 991 |
|    | <i>Report to the Canadian Judicial Council of the Inquiry Committee Established Pursuant to Subsection 63(1) of the Judges Act at the Request of the Attorney General of Nova Scotia</i> ..... | 992 |
|    | 3. Aboriginal Over-representation .....                                                                                                                                                        | 996 |

|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |      |
|----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------|
|    | The Royal Commission on Aboriginal People,<br><i>Bridging the Cultural Divide: A Report on<br/>Aboriginal People and Criminal Justice in<br/>Canada</i> .....                                                                                                                               | 996  |
|    | Presentation to the Commission of First Nations<br>and Métis People and Justice Reform (Correctional<br>Service of Canada, May 2003) in Commission on<br>First Nations and Métis Peoples and Justice<br>Reform, <i>Final Report, Vol. II: Submissions to the<br/>Commission</i> .....       | 1001 |
| 4. | Systemic Racism .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | 1002 |
|    | <i>R. v. Williams</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 1003 |
|    | Presentation to the Commission of First Nations<br>and Métis People and Justice Reform (Correctional<br>Service of Canada, May 2003) in Commission on<br>First Nations and Métis Peoples and Justice<br>Reform, <i>Final Report, Vol. I: Legacy of Hope: An<br/>Agenda for Change</i> ..... | 1013 |
| C. | Aboriginal Traditions and Justice .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | 1015 |
|    | Jarvis Papers Collection # 5 S-125, Volume B. 57 .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | 1016 |
|    | <i>R. v. Machekequonabe</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | 1019 |
|    | <i>R. v. Jacko</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | 1021 |
| D. | Reforming the Criminal Justice System .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | 1027 |
|    | The Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples,<br><i>Bridging the Cultural Divide: A Report on Aboriginal<br/>People and Criminal Justice in Canada</i> .....                                                                                                                                  | 1028 |
|    | <i>R. v. Moses</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | 1028 |
|    | <i>R. v. Gladue</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | 1048 |
| E. | Aboriginal Justice Systems .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | 1061 |
|    | "The Argument for Aboriginal Justice Systems" .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | 1061 |
|    | Bryan Schwartz, "A Separate Aboriginal<br>Justice System?" .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | 1062 |
| F. | Conclusion .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | 1066 |
|    | <i>Index</i> .....                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | 1069 |