

Edited by Louis A. Knafla and Haijo Westra

Aboriginal Title and Indigenous
Peoples: Canada, Australia,
and New Zealand



UBCPress • Vancouver • Toronto

© UBC Press 2010

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without prior written permission of the publisher, or, in Canada, in the case of photocopying or other reprographic copying, a licence from Access Copyright (Canadian Copyright Licensing Agency), www.accesscopyright.ca.

20 19 18 17 16 15 14 13 12 11 10 5 4 3 2 1

Printed in Canada on FSC-certified ancient-forest-free paper (100% post-consumer recycled) that is processed chlorine- and acid-free.

Library and Archives Canada Cataloguing in Publication

Aboriginal title and indigenous peoples : Canada, Australia, and New Zealand /
edited by Louis A. Knafla and Haijo Westra.

(Law and society, ISSN 1496-4953)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-7748-1560-4

1. Aboriginal title – Canada. 2. Native title (Australia). 3. Maori (New Zealand people) – Land tenure. 4. Native peoples – Legal status, laws, etc. – Canada. 5. Indigenous peoples – Legal status, laws, etc. – Australia. 6. Maori (New Zealand people) – Legal status, laws, etc. I. Knafla, Louis A., 1935- II. Westra, Haijo Jan, 1947- III. Series: Law and society series (Vancouver, B.C.)

KE7739.L3A265 2010

346.7104'3208997

C2010-900142-7

KF8224.L2A265 2010

Canada

UBC Press gratefully acknowledges the financial support for our publishing program of the Government of Canada (through the Canada Book Fund), the Canada Council for the Arts, and the British Columbia Arts Council.

This book has been published with the help of a grant from the Canadian Federation for the Humanities and Social Sciences, through the Aid to Scholarly Publications Programme, using funds provided by the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada.

UBC Press

The University of British Columbia

2029 West Mall

Vancouver, BC V6T 1Z2

www.ubcpress.ca

Contents

INTRODUCTION

“This Is Our Land”: Aboriginal Title at Customary and Common Law
in Comparative Contexts / 1

Louis A. Knafla

Part 1: Sovereignty, Extinguishment, and Expropriation of Aboriginal Title

- 1** From the US Indian Claims Commission Cases to *Delgamuukw*:
Facts, Theories, and Evidence in North American Land Claims / 37
Arthur Ray
- 2** Social Theory, Expert Evidence, and the *Yorta Yorta* Rights Appeal
Decision / 53
Bruce Rigsby
- 3** Law's Infidelity to Its Past: The Failure to Recognize Indigenous
Jurisdiction in Australia and Canada / 85
David Yarrow
- 4** The Defence of Native Title and Dominion in Sixteenth-Century
Mexico Compared with *Delgamuukw* / 100
Haijo Westra
- 5** Beyond Aboriginal Title in Yukon: First Nations Land Registries / 108
Brian Ballantyne

Part 2: Native Land, Litigation, and Indigenous Rights

- 6** The “Race” for Recognition: Toward a Policy of Recognition of
Aboriginal Peoples in Canada / 125
Paul L.A.H. Chartrand

- 7** The Sources and Content of Indigenous Land Rights in Australia and Canada: A Critical Comparison / 146
Kent McNeil
- 8** Common Law, Statutory Law, and the Political Economy of the Recognition of Indigenous Australian Rights in Land / 171
Nicolas Peterson
- 9** Claiming Native Title in the Foreshore and Seabed / 185
Jacinta Ruru
- 10** Waterpower Developments and Native Water Rights Struggles in the North American West in the Early Twentieth Century: A View from Three Stoney Nakoda Cases / 202
Kenichi Matsui
- CONCLUSION
Power and Principle: State-Indigenous Relations across Time and Space / 214
Peter W. Hutchins
- Acknowledgments / 229
- Selected Bibliography / 230
- Contributors / 249
- General Index / 253
- Index of Cases / 262
- Index of Statutes, Treaties, and Agreements / 265