

Aboriginal Title in British Columbia:

Delgamuukw v. The Queen

*Proceedings of a conference
held September 10 & 11, 1991*

Edited by Frank Cassidy



co-published by
Oolichan Books
and



The Institute for Research on Public Policy
L'Institut de recherches politiques

1992

Copyright © 1992 by The Institute for Research on Public Policy

ISBN 0-88982-115-1 Oolichan Books

ISBN 0-88645-138-8 IRPP

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED. No part of this book may be reproduced by any means, electronic or mechanical, without permission in writing from the publisher, except by a reviewer who may quote brief passages in a review to be printed in a newspaper or magazine or broadcast on radio or television.

Canadian Cataloguing in Publication Data

Main entry under title:

Aboriginal title in British Columbia

Co-published by the Institute for Research on Public Policy.

Based on a conference held in Victoria, B.C., Sept. 10-11, 1991.

ISBN 0-88982-115-1 (Oolichan).—ISBN 0-88645-144-2 (IRPP)

1. Kitksan Indians—Land tenure—Congresses. 2. Wet'suwet'en Indians—Land tenure—Congresses. 3. Kitksan Indians—Claims—Congresses. 4. Wet'suwet'en Indians—Claims—Congresses. 5. Kitksan Indians—Land transfers—Congresses. 6. Wet'suwet'en Indians—Land transfers—Congresses. 7. Indians of North America—British Columbia—Land tenure—Congresses. 8. Indians of North America—British Columbia—Claims—Congresses. 9. Indians of North America—British Columbia—Land transfers—Congresses. I. Cassidy, Frank. II. Institute for Research on Public Policy.
KEB529.5.L3A26 1992 346.71104'32'089972 C92-091418-7

Cover photo: Stephen Bosch

Publication of this book has been financially assisted by The Canada Council.

Published by

Oolichan Books

P.O. Box 10

Lantzville, BC V0R 2H0

and

The Institute for Research on Public Policy

1470, rue Peel

Bureau 200

Montreal, Quebec H3A 1T1

Typeset by Vancouver Desktop Publishing Centre

Printed in Canada by

Hignell Printing Limited

Winnipeg, Manitoba

Contents

Foreword	ix
Welcome	1
Samuel Sam	3
Tribal Elder	
First Nations of South Island Tribal Council	
Delgamuukw (Earl Muldon)	3
Gitksan Hereditary Chief	
Gisdaywa (Alfred Joseph)	4
Wet'suwet'en Hereditary Chief	
Introduction	
Rethinking British Columbia: The Challenge of <i>Delgamuukw</i>	5
Frank Cassidy	
Associate Professor	
School of Public Administration	
University of Victoria	
1. The Judgment	19
<i>Delgamuukw</i>: A Summary of the Judgment	21
Peter T. Burns	
Professor of Law	
University of British Columbia and	
Associate Counsel	
Blake, Cassels and Graydon	
<i>Delgamuukw</i> and the Fiduciary Duty of the Crown	35
E. Robert A. Edwards	
Deputy Attorney General	
Province of British Columbia	
The Fiduciary Obligations of the Crown Towards Aboriginal Peoples	44
Michael Hudson	
Senior Counsel, Legal Services	
Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development	
2. The Hereditary Chiefs Speak	51
The Fire Within Us	53
Satsan (Herb George)	
Chief	

Remove Not the Landmark	58
Miluulak (Alice Jeffrey)	
Gitksan Hereditary Chief	
Deep Within Our Spirit	62
Wigetimstochol (Dan Michell)	
Wet'suwet'en Hereditary Chief	
3. The Historical Dimension	67
The Wisdom of the Elders	69
Simon Baker	
Elder	
The Squamish Nation	
The Place of <i>Delgamuukw</i> in British Columbia History	
and Politics—And Vice Versa	73
Paul Tennant	
Associate Professor	
Department of Political Science	
University of British Columbia	
4. The Legal Dimension	93
Canada on Trial	95
Tom Sampson	
Chairman	
First Nations of South Island Tribal Council	
A Theory of Aboriginal Rights	97
Burton H. Kellock	
Senior Litigation Partner	
Blake, Cassels & Graydon	
Fiona C.M. Anderson	
Associate	
Blake, Cassels & Graydon	
The Legal Basis of Aboriginal Title	113
Brian Slattery	
Associate Professor	
Osgoode Hall Law School	
York University	
It Goes Without Saying: The Doctrine of Extinguishment	
by Implication in <i>Delgamuukw</i>	133
Hamar Foster	
Associate Professor	
Faculty of Law	
University of Victoria	

“The General Sense of Things”: <i>Delgamuukw</i> and the Courts	161
Bryan Schwartz Professor of Law University of Manitoba	
Litigating Aboriginal Rights Cases	178
Marvin R.V. Storrow Senior Litigation Partner Blake, Cassels & Graydon	
Michael J. Bryant Third Year Law Student Osgoode Hall Law School York University	
The Law and Justice: A Contradiction?	193
George Watts Chairman Nuu-chah-nulth Tribal Council	
5. The Human Dimension	197
It Will Always Be The Truth	199
Yagalahl (Dora Wilson) Member Gitksan-Wet’suwet’en Litigation Team	
Fieldwork in Courtroom 53: A Witness to <i>Delgamuukw</i>	206
Robin Ridington Professor Department of Anthropology University of British Columbia	
Errors in <i>Delgamuukw</i>: An Anthropological Perspective	221
Michael Asch Professor Department of Anthropology University of Alberta	
6. The Political Dimension	245
Power, the Law and Constitution-Making	247
Roland Penner Dean Faculty of Law University of Manitoba	

Our Rights Will Not Be Forfeited	253
Ethel Blondin	
Member of Parliament	
Western Arctic	
7. The International Dimension	259
Getting Back to Rights	261
Doug Sanders	
Professor	
Faculty of Law	
University of British Columbia	
Colonialism: The Root of the Problem	288
Donald Rojas	
President	
World Council of Indigenous Peoples	
Understanding the Power Culture	291
Tipene O'Regan	
Ngai Tahu Maori Trust Board	
New Zealand	
The Road Is Long	297
Clayton H.W. Hee	
Chairman	
Board of Trustees	
Office of Hawaiian Affairs	
8. A Final Comment	301
It Doesn't Matter What the Judge Said	303
Medig'm Gyamk (Neil Sterritt)	
Chairman	
Chiefs' Governance Working Group	
Office of the Hereditary Chiefs of the Gitksan and	
Wet'suwet'en People	
Appendix	309
<i>Delgamuukw v. The Queen</i> (an excerpt)	311
The Contributors	322