

# Broken Landscape

*Indians, Indian Tribes, and  
the Constitution*

FRANK POMMERSHEIM

**OXFORD**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS  
2009

# OXFORD

UNIVERSITY PRESS

Oxford University Press, Inc., publishes works that further  
Oxford University's objective of excellence  
in research, scholarship, and education.

Oxford New York  
Auckland Cape Town Dar es Salaam Hong Kong Karachi  
Kuala Lumpur Madrid Melbourne Mexico City Nairobi  
New Delhi Shanghai Taipei Toronto

With offices in  
Argentina Austria Brazil Chile Czech Republic France Greece  
Guatemala Hungary Italy Japan Poland Portugal Singapore  
South Korea Switzerland Thailand Turkey Ukraine Vietnam

Copyright © 2009 by Frank Pommersheim

Published by Oxford University Press, Inc.  
198 Madison Avenue, New York, New York 10016  
[www.oup.com](http://www.oup.com)

Oxford is a registered trademark of Oxford University Press

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced,  
stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means,  
electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise,  
without the prior permission of Oxford University Press.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Pommersheim, Frank.

Broken landscape: Indians, Indian tribes, and the constitution /  
Frank Pommersheim.

p. cm.

Includes index.

ISBN 978-0-19-537306-6

1. Indians of North America—Legal status, laws, etc.—History.

2. Constitutional history—United States. 3. United States. Supreme Court—  
History. 4. Indians of North America—Government relations. 5. Indians of

North America—Politics and government. 6. Indians of North America—

Civil rights—History. 7. Tribal government—United States. 8. Sovereignty. I. Title.

KF8205.P636 2009

342.7308'72—dc22 2008046841

9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Printed in the United States of America  
on acid-free paper

# Contents

## **Part One: The Early Encounter**

1. Introduction: A New Challenge to Old Assumptions, 3
2. Early Contact: From Colonial Encounters to the Articles of Confederation, 9
3. Second Opportunity: The Structure and Architecture of the Constitution, 33
4. The Marshall Trilogy: Foundational but Not Fully Constitutional?, 87
5. *Lone Wolf v. Hitchcock*: The Birth of Plenary Power, Incorporation, and an Extraconstitutional Regime, 125

## **Part Two: Individual Indians and the Constitution**

6. *Elk v. Wilkins*: Exclusion, Inclusion, and the Ambiguities of Citizenship, 155
7. Indians and the First Amendment: The Illusion of Religious Freedom?, 183

## **Part Three: The Modern Encounter**

8. Indian Law Jurisprudence in the Modern Era: A Common Law Approach without Constitutional Principle, 211

X CONTENTS

9. International Law Perspective: A New Model of Indigenous Nation Sovereignty?, 259
10. Conclusion: Imagination, Translation, and Constitutional Convergence, 295

Notes, 313

Index, 407