

Commercial Implications of Native Title

Editors

Bryan Horrigan

BA, LLB (Hons) (Qld), D Phil (Oxon), Solicitor

Associate Professor, Faculty of Law, Queensland University of Technology

Consultant, Allen Allen & Hemsley

Member of the Centre for Commercial and Property Law, Queensland University of
Technology

Simon Young

BA, LLB (Hons) (Qld), A Mus A, Solicitor

Senior Research Assistant, Centre for Commercial and Property Law, Queensland
University of Technology

THE FEDERATION PRESS

in association with

The Centre for Commercial and Property Law
Queensland University of Technology

1997

Published in Sydney by

The Federation Press

PO Box 45, Annandale, NSW, 2038

Unit 3, 56-72 John Street, Leichhardt, NSW, 2040

Telephone (02) 9552 2200 Fax (02) 9552 1681

National Library of Australia Cataloguing-in-Publication

Commercial implications of native title

Includes index.

ISBN 1 86287 218 X

I. Australia. Native Title Act 1993. 2. Native title – Economic aspects. 3. Aborigines, Australian – Land tenure – Economic aspects. 4. Land tenure – Economic aspects – Australia. 5. Torres Strait Islanders – Land tenure – Economic aspects. I. Horrigan, Bryan. II. Young, Simon. III. Queensland University of Technology. Centre for Commercial and Property Law.

© The Federation Press and contributors

This publication is copyright. Other than for the purposes of and subject to the conditions prescribed under the Copyright Act, no part of it may in any form or by any means (electronic, mechanical, microcopying, photocopying, recording or otherwise) be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted without prior written permission. Enquiries should be addressed to the publisher.

Typeset by The Federation Press, Leichhardt, NSW.

Printed and bound by Ligare Pty Ltd, Riverwood, NSW.

Contents

Foreword	v
Preface	xi
List of Contributors	xix
Table of Cases	xxii
Table of Legislation	xxvii

Part I

Key Developments in Native Title Law and Policy

1	Native Title Overview: Commercial Dimensions and Ongoing Developments	2
	<i>Bryan Horrigan</i>	
1.1	Overview of developments	2
1.2	Fundamental questions and answers	4
1.3	Three solutions – negotiation, litigation, or legislation?	12
1.4	The implications of <i>Wik Peoples v. Queensland</i>	14
1.5	Agreement models	16
1.6	Negotiating for and with Indigenous groups	21
1.7	Legislative changes to the <i>Native Title Act 1993 (Cth)</i>	22
1.8	Conclusion	28
2	The National Native Title Tribunal's Experience: Promise, Pain and Progress	29
	<i>Justice R.S. French</i>	
2.1	Introduction	29
2.2	The starting point	30
2.3	The Tribunal under the <i>Native Title Act 1993 (Cth)</i>	33
2.4	The Tribunal's mediation process	42
2.5	Power imbalance in mediation	45
2.6	Mediations in progress	46
2.7	The right to negotiate process	52
2.8	Specific project agreements	54
2.9	Native title agreements and their support – some reform proposals	56
2.10	Conclusion	59
3	A Working Guide to Australian Native Title Legislation in All Jurisdictions	61
	<i>Carmel MacDonald</i>	
3.1	Introduction	61
3.2	<i>Mabo v. Queensland (No.2)</i> : a brief summary	62
3.3	The <i>Native Title Act 1993 (Cth)</i>	62
3.4	Outline of The <i>Native Title Act 1993 (Cth)</i>	63
3.5	The national legislative scheme	81
3.6	Conclusion	91

CONTENTS

4	Implications for Government Decision-Making: Policy, Legislation and Grants of Title	. 92
	<i>Dominic McGann and David Yarrow</i>	
4.1	Introduction	92
4.2	Native title, the policy development process and legislation	94
4.3	Grants of title	100
4.4	Policy implications of the <i>Wik</i> decision	111
4.5	Conclusions	111
 Part II Commercial Sector Implications		
5	Commercial Implications of Native Title for Mining and Resources	114
	<i>K.D. MacDonald</i>	
5.1	Introduction	114
5.2	Expiry of valid existing titles	115
5.3	Renewals, extensions and grants pursuant to options	117
5.4	New titles acquired or granted	117
5.5	Extinguishment of native title at common law	118
5.6	Impact on the mining industry	119
5.7	The legislative future	121
5.8	Bargaining strength	122
5.9	Infrastructure	124
5.10	Conclusion	125
6	Ownership and Control of Natural Resources and Their Impact on Native Title	126
	<i>David Yarrow</i>	
6.1	Introduction	126
6.2	Common law on the regulation, impairment and extinguishment of native title	127
6.3	The impact of the <i>Racial Discrimination Act</i> 1975 (Cth) upon the regulation, impairment and extinguishment of native title	133
6.4	The operation of the <i>Native Title Act</i> 1993 (Cth)	134
6.5	The impact of the environmental and natural resources legislation on native title	139
6.6	Conclusion	155
7	Native Title and Freshwater Resources	157
	<i>Poh-Ling Tan</i>	
7.1	Introduction	157
7.2	Background	158
7.3	The existence and nature of native title to freshwater resources	160
7.4	Extinguishment	180
7.5	Conclusion	198

CONTENTS

8	Financial, Accounting and Auditing Implications	200
	<i>Craig Jackson and Michael Bray</i>	
8.1	Introduction	200
8.2	Financial implications	202
8.3	Accounting and financial reporting implications	207
8.4	Auditing implications	213
8.5	Conclusion	213
9	Practical Implications for Financiers, Land Dealers, Investors and Professional Advisers	215
	<i>Bryan Horrigan</i>	
9.1	Overview	216
9.2	Financing and security contexts	217
9.3	Native title “risk” categories	217
9.4	Prospectus guidelines	218
9.5	Native title and property financing – a storm in a teacup?	219
9.6	Key questions	220
9.7	Sources of enquiry	222
9.8	Native title provisions in documents – four different examples	223
9.9	Integrated risk management	226
9.10	Valuation implications	228
9.11	Steps for advisers using the <i>Native Title Act</i> to check titles	228
9.12	Four main areas of practical concern for financing and security arrangements	232
	Appendix: Key questions and reference points for professional advisers using the <i>Native Title Act</i> to advise on security of title	235

Part III Native Title Dispute Resolution

10	Proof of Native Title	240
	<i>Graeme Neate</i>	
10.1	Introduction	240
10.2	What is native title?	242
10.3	In what circumstances must native title be proved?	243
10.4	What has to be proved?	246
10.5	What procedures can be adopted to prove native title?	267
10.6	Conclusion	318
11	Negotiating Resource Development Agreements with Indigenous People: Comparative International Lessons	320
	<i>M.A. Stephenson</i>	
11.1	Introduction	320
11.2	Indigenous land in North America	321
11.3	The negotiation of mining agreements – strategies for Australia?	337
11.4	Terms in negotiated agreements in North America	346
11.5	Resource development in Australia	361
11.6	Conclusion	373

CONTENTS

12	The Legal, Political and Commercial Implications of the High Court's <i>Wik</i> Decision – The Way Ahead	375
	<i>Bryan Horrigan</i>	
12.1	Overview	375
12.2	The <i>Wik</i> decision	377
12.3	Political assumptions	379
12.4	The post- <i>Wik</i> world	381
12.5	Legislative options after <i>Wik</i>	384
12.6	Negotiation options after <i>Wik</i>	390
12.7	Litigation options after <i>Wik</i>	391
12.8	Implications for legal advisers	392
12.9	Implications for holders of existing mining and pastoral titles	395
12.10	Implications for applicants for new mining and pastoral titles	398
12.11	Implications for financiers	399
12.12	Implications for valuers	401
12.13	Implications for other professional advisers	402
12.14	Implications for native title claimants	402
12.15	Unanswered questions	403
	 Appendix 1: Cape York Heads of Agreement	 404
	 Appendix 2: Crescent Head agreement	 407
	 Index	 413