

Compromised Jurisprudence

Native title cases since Mabo

SECOND EDITION

Lisa Strelein



Aboriginal
Studies
Press

First published in 2006 by Aboriginal Studies Press
Second edition published in 2009 by Aboriginal Studies Press

© Lisa Strelein 2009

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording or by any information storage and retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publisher. The *Australian Copyright Act 1968* (the Act) allows a maximum of one chapter or 10 per cent of this book, whichever is the greater, to be photocopied by any educational institution for its education purposes provided that the educational institution (or body that administers it) has given a remuneration notice to Copyright Agency Limited (CAL) under the Act.

Aboriginal Studies Press is the publishing arm of the Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies.
GPO Box 553, Canberra, ACT 2601
Phone: (61 2) 6246 1183
Fax: (61 2) 6261 4288
Email: asp@aiatsis.gov.au
Web: www.aiatsis.gov.au/asp/about.html

National Library of Australia
Cataloguing-In-Publication data:

Author: Strelein, Lisa.

Title: Compromised jurisprudence : native title cases since Mabo / Lisa Strelein.

Edition: 2nd ed.

ISBN: 9780855756635 (pbk.)

Notes: Includes index. Bibliography.

Subjects: Native title (Australia) — Case studies.

Jurisprudence — Australia.

Dewey Number: 346.9404320899915

Cover image: *Into the Wanyarang sunset* © Shane Pickett,
Indigenart, The Mossenson Galleries, www.indigenart.com.au.

Index by Sherrey Quinn

Printed in Australia by BPA Print Group Pty Ltd

CONTENTS

Preface	ix
Acknowledgments	xi
Introduction	1
The law before <i>Mabo</i>	2
The legislative responses	3
The <i>Native Title Act 1993</i>	5
<i>Wik</i> and the Ten-Point Plan	6
Relationship between the common law and the legislation	7
1. Recognising native title in Australian law:	9
<i>Mabo v Queensland [No. 2]</i>	
The consequences of settlement	10
Establishing title	10
The nature and content of native title	14
Extinguishing title	16
Wrongful extinguishment	18
Conclusion	21
2. Coexistence and necessary inconsistency:	22
<i>Wik Peoples v Queensland</i>	
Nature of the inquiry	23
History of pastoral leases under statute	24
Applying the rules of statutory construction	25
The arguments in favour of exclusive possession	26
Arguments against exclusive possession	29
The conditional nature of the grant	30
A presumption of beneficial construction	31
Conclusions as to necessary extinguishment	31
Extinguishment and the test of inconsistency	33

3. The vulnerability of native title: <i>Fejo v Northern Territory</i>	36
The freehold question	37
A 'bundle of rights'	38
A unique title	39
A new vulnerability	40
Revival and extinguishment	41
Conclusion	43
4. Property and Crown ownership: <i>Yanner v Eaton</i>	44
The nature of property	44
'Vesting' and Crown property	45
Extinguishment, inconsistency and regulation	45
Conclusion	48
5. Native title offshore: <i>Commonwealth v Yarmirr</i>	49
Recognition of native title over the sea	50
Crown sovereignty over the sea	50
The public rights to navigate and to fish	52
Non-exclusivity and enforcement	53
Conclusion	54
6. Redefining extinguishment: <i>Western Australia v Ward</i>	55
Extinguishment under the <i>Native Title Act 1993</i>	57
The <i>Racial Discrimination Act</i> and compensation	59
Proof of native title	61
The 'bundle of rights' debate	61
Connection to land	63
Non-exclusive native title	65
Principles for extinguishment under the <i>Native Title Act</i>	68
Partial extinguishment and coexistence	71
The <i>Wilson v Anderson</i> decision	72
Conclusion	72
7. Proof of a native title society: <i>Yorta Yorta v Victoria</i>	74
Tradition and continuity in <i>Yorta Yorta</i>	74
The intersection of normative systems	76
What has to be proved	77
Continuity and change in tradition	78
Conclusion	80

8. Rules of interpretation:	82
<i>Griffiths v Minister for Lands, Planning and Environment</i>	
The statutory framework	82
Public purpose and private benefit	83
The absence of clear and plain intent	84
Conclusion	86
9. Implementing the High Court's jurisprudence:	87
<i>De Rose v South Australia [No. 2]</i>	
Connection to land	88
Social and political life	89
Physical access	90
The evidence of Indigenous witnesses and the role of experts	91
Alternative determination and extinguishment	92
The Federal Court appeal	92
Who can claim native title?	94
Determining the impact of partial extinguishment	96
10. Continuity and change: <i>Bodney v Bennell</i>	97
The existence of a Noongar society	98
The continuity question	99
The appeal	100
Continuity and 'unacceptable' change	100
'For each generation'	105
Communal title and the recognition level	107
Connection	112
Conclusion	114
11. The development of native title jurisprudence	116
12. The jurisprudence of native title:	126
' Recognition ' and ' protection '	
Native title and the assertion of Crown sovereignty	128
Non-recognition	130
The juxtaposition of recognition and denial	133
What is recognised: the nature and extent of the title	135
Sustaining recognition: the maintenance of connection	139
The 'recognition level': who holds native title?	141
The limits of protection: extinguishment of native title	144
Conclusion	148
Notes	151
Annotated case list	183
Bibliography	231
Index	242