

Discovering Indigenous Lands

*The Doctrine of Discovery in the
English Colonies*

ROBERT J. MILLER, JACINTA RURU, LARISSA
BEHRENDT, AND TRACEY LINDBERG

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

OXFORD

UNIVERSITY PRESS

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford OX2 6DP

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford.
It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship,
and education by publishing worldwide in

Oxford New York

Auckland Cape Town Dar es Salaam Hong Kong Karachi

Kuala Lumpur Madrid Melbourne Mexico City Nairobi

New Delhi Shanghai Taipei Toronto

With offices in

Argentina Austria Brazil Chile Czech Republic France Greece

Guatemala Hungary Italy Japan Poland Portugal Singapore

South Korea Switzerland Thailand Turkey Ukraine Vietnam

Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press
in the UK and in certain other countries

Published in the United States

by Oxford University Press Inc., New York

© Robert J. Miller, Jacinta Ruru, Larissa Behrendt, and Tracey Lindberg, 2010

The moral rights of the authors have been asserted

Crown copyright material is reproduced under Class Licence

Number C01P0000148 with the permission of OPSI

and the Queen's Printer for Scotland

Database right Oxford University Press (maker)

First published 2010

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced,
stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means,
without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press,
or as expressly permitted by law, or under terms agreed with the appropriate
reprographics rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction
outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department,
Oxford University Press, at the address above

You must not circulate this book in any other binding or cover
and you must impose the same condition on any acquirer

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Data available

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Typeset by Newgen Imaging Systems (P) Ltd., Chennai, India

Printed in Great Britain

on acid-free paper by

CPI Antony Rowe

ISBN 978-0-19-957981-5

3 5 7 9 10 8 6 4 2

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	xiii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xv
<i>Table of Legislation and Analogous Documents</i>	xix
1. The Doctrine of Discovery	1
<i>Robert J. Miller</i>	
A. The Doctrine of Discovery	3
B. The Development of the International Law of Discovery	9
C. England and the Doctrine of Discovery	15
2. The Legal Adoption of Discovery in the United States	26
<i>Robert J. Miller</i>	
A. American Colonial Law of Discovery	27
1. Colonial statutory laws	27
2. Colonial courts	31
3. Royal attempts to enforce Discovery	33
B. American State Law of Discovery	36
1. State laws	36
2. State court cases	39
C. American Federal Law of Discovery	41
1. Articles of Confederation Congress 1781–1789	42
2. United States constitutional era	47
D. Fundamental Principles of Federal Indian Law	61
1. Plenary power	61
2. Trust doctrine	62
3. Diminished tribal sovereignty	64
3. The Doctrine of Discovery in United States History	66
<i>Robert J. Miller</i>	
A. 1789–1830	66
1. Secretary of State Jefferson	67
2. President Jefferson	69
3. Lewis and Clark expedition	69
4. Louisiana Purchase	74
5. Jefferson and Madison administrations	76

6. US Congress	77
7. Monroe administration	78
B. 1830–1850	81
1. Manifest Destiny	82
2. President James K Polk	83
3. Mexican-American War 1846–1848	85
4. American settlers	85
C. 1850–1887	86
D. 1887–1934	86
E. Conclusion	88
4. The Doctrine of Discovery in Canada	89
<i>Tracey Lindberg</i>	
A. The Earth is Our Mother: Meta-Indigenous Conceptualizations of Our Relationship with Our Land	89
B. Indigenous Ideologies and Understandings	90
C. Indigenous Identification of Problems with Colonial Research, History, and Narrative	92
D. The Doctrine of Discovery	93
1. Defined	93
2. Sources	94
3. Theory	97
4. Practice	97
E. The Doctrine of Discovery in Canada: Early Era	98
1. Colonizer philosophies and law	100
2. Colonizing belief and peoples	101
F. Early Documentation	104
1. Constitutional documents	104
2. Treaties	107
3. Legislation	113
4. Early case law	119
G. Conclusion	124
5. Contemporary Canadian Resonance of an Imperial Doctrine	126
<i>Tracey Lindberg</i>	
A. Contemporary Documentation	128
1. Constitutional documentation	128
2. <i>Terra nullius</i>	131
3. Treaty cases and Canadian treaty interpretation	132
4. Legislation	138
5. Canadian case law	148
B. Changing Policy and Modern Day Agreements	161
C. Conclusion	167

6. The Doctrine of Discovery in Australia	171
<i>Larissa Behrendt</i>	
A. First Contacts	171
B. Aboriginal Society and Practices	172
C. Claiming Australia	174
D. Invasion	176
E. Asserting the Doctrine of Discovery	177
F. <i>Terra Nullius</i> as the Exercise of the Doctrine of Discovery	179
G. Contesting <i>Terra Nullius</i>	183
H. Why no Treaty?	185
7. Asserting the Doctrine of Discovery in Australia	187
<i>Larissa Behrendt</i>	
A. Drafting the Australian Constitution	187
B. The Legacy of the Framers	188
C. Challenging the Status Quo	191
D. The <i>Mabo</i> Case: Overturning the Doctrine of <i>Terra Nullius</i>	192
E. Legislative Recognition of Rights	195
F. Land Rights Legislation	197
G. Contemporary Aspirations for the Recognition of Sovereignty and the Protection of Indigenous Rights	198
H. 'The Northern Territory Intervention': Continuing Legislative Power over Aboriginal People and their Rights	201
1. Welfare quarantining	202
2. Housing policy	204
8. Asserting the Doctrine of Discovery in Aotearoa New Zealand: 1840–1960s	207
<i>Jacinta Ruru</i>	
A. Background	208
B. Claiming Sovereignty: Treaty of Waitangi 1840	209
C. <i>Symonds</i> 1847	214
D. Native Acts 1860s	217
E. <i>Wi Parata</i> 1877	219
F. Privy Council Decisions Early 1900s	221
G. Cases and Policy in the 1960s	223
H. Conclusion	226
9. The Still Permeating Influence of the Doctrine of Discovery in Aotearoa/New Zealand: 1970s–2000s	227
<i>Jacinta Ruru</i>	
A. Case Law Era	228
1. <i>Te Weehi</i> 1986	229
2. <i>Lands</i> case 1987	229

3. <i>Muriwhenua Te Ika Whenua and McRitchie</i> 1990s	231
4. <i>Ngati Apa</i> 2003	232
B. Settlement Statute Era	235
1. National parks	236
2. Foreshore and seabed	237
C. Future Constitutional Era	239
1. A constitutional document?	240
2. Reciprocity principle	242
D. Wider Judicial Support	244
E. Conclusion	246
 10. Concluding Comparatively: Discovery in the English Colonies	 247
<i>Jacinta Ruru</i>	
A. Comparative Law	247
B. Comparative Analysis	249
1. First discovery	249
2. Actual occupancy and current possession	251
3. Preemption/European title	253
4. Indian/Native title	255
5. Indigenous nations limited sovereign and commercial rights	257
6. Contiguity	258
7. <i>Terra nullius</i>	260
8. Christianity	262
9. Civilization	263
10. Conquest	264
11. Summary	265
C. Conclusion	266
 <i>Bibliography</i>	 268
<i>Index</i>	285