

Freedom and Indigenous Constitutionalism

JOHN BORROWS

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO PRESS
Toronto Buffalo London

© University of Toronto Press 2016
Toronto Buffalo London
www.utppublishing.com
Printed in Canada

ISBN 978-1-4426-3093-2 (cloth) ISBN 978-1-4426-2923-3 (paper)

- ♻️ Printed on acid-free, 100% post-consumer recycled paper
with vegetable-based inks.

Library and Archives Canada Cataloguing in Publication

Borrows, John, 1963–, author
Freedom and indigenous constitutionalism / John Borrows.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-4426-3093-2 (cloth). – ISBN 978-1-4426-2923-3 (paper)

1. Native peoples – Legal status, laws, etc. – Canada. 2. Native peoples –
Canada – Politics and government. 3. Native peoples – Civil rights –
Canada. 4. Ojibwa law. I. Title.

KE7709.B6738 2016 342.7108'72 C2016-900084-2
KF8205.B6738 2016

University of Toronto Press acknowledges the financial assistance to its
publishing program of the Canada Council for the Arts and the Ontario Arts
Council, an agency of the Government of Ontario.



Canada Council
for the Arts

Conseil des Arts
du Canada



ONTARIO ARTS COUNCIL
CONSEIL DES ARTS DE L'ONTARIO
an Ontario government agency
un organisme du gouvernement de l'Ontario

Funded by the
Government
of Canada

Financé par le
gouvernement
du Canada

Canada

Contents

Miigwech ix

Introduction 3

- 1 Physical Philosophy: Mobility and Indigenous Freedom 19
 - A. Methodologies of Mobility: Physical Philosophy 21
 - B. Models of Mobility 23
 - C. Manipulating Mobility: Settled and Unsettled Law 27
 - i) 'Damned if We Move': The Too Unsettled Thesis 29
 - ii) '... and Damned if We Don't': The Too Settled Thesis 31
 - D. Recognizing and Affirming Indigenous Physical Mobility 35
 - E. Recognizing and Affirming Indigenous Conceptual Mobility 40
 - i) Indigenous Governments and Personal Relationships 41
 - ii) Indigenous Governments and Institutional Relationships 44
 - F. Conclusion 48
- 2 Civil (Dis)Obedience, Freedom, and Democracy 50
 - A. Moving Beyond Abstractions: Remembering Grounded Histories 52
 - B. Group One: Best Practices (so far) in Indigenous Civil (Dis)obedience 55
 - i) Moresby Island, Haida Gwaii, British Columbia 55
 - ii) James Bay 61

iii) Chippewas of the Nawash	65
iv) Clayoquot Sound	70
C. Group Two: Helping Others, Failing at Home	74
i) Oka/Kanesatake, Quebec	74
ii) Burnt Church	78
D. Group Three: Diminishing Democracy and Eroding Freedom, Generally and Specifically	84
i) Anicinabe Park	84
ii) Algonquins of Barriere Lake	88
iii) Temagami Anishinaabe	94
E. Conclusion	100
3 Indigenous Freedom and Canadian Constitutionalism	103
A. Constitutional Complexities	105
B. Constitutional Suspicions	110
C. Constitutional Discussions	112
D. Constitutional Amendment: Strategies and Debates	115
E. Constitutional Entrenchment	120
F. Constitutional Conferences and Accords	122
G. Conclusion	126
4 (Ab)Originalism and Canada's Constitution	128
A. (Ab)Originalism and Living Trees: Analysing Modes of Interpretation	129
B. (Ab)Originalism and the Canons of Construction	136
i) Treaties, Originalism, and the Canons of Construction	137
ii) Aboriginal Rights, Originalism, and the Canons of Construction	139
C. (Ab)Originalism as Adverse Discrimination	142
D. Three Alternatives to (Ab)Originalism	147
E. Indigenous Legal Traditions, Living Trees, and Originalism	151
F. Conclusion	156

5	Legislation and Indigenous Self-Determination in Canada and the United States	161
	A. Indigenous Control of Federal Services	166
	B. Protection of Indigenous Cultures and Communities	170
	C. Indigenous Control in Relation to Economic Development, Environment, and Natural Resources	175
	D. Conclusion	179
6	Aboriginal and Treaty Rights and Violence against Women	181
	A. The Problem and/or the Answer: Indigenous Self-Determination and Violence against Women	184
	B. Indigenous Governments: Can They Be Trusted?	188
	C. Section 35(1) and Violence against Women	196
	i) Aboriginal Rights: Violence against Women and the 'Integral to the Distinctive Culture' Test	197
	ii) Violence against Women and Treaties	200
	D. Conclusion	202
	Conclusion	205
	Pitchii	209
	Notes	215
	Index	359