

Lords of The Land

Indigenous Property Rights and The Jurisprudence of Empire

MARK HICKFORD DPhil (Oxon)

2008 New Zealand Law Foundation International Research Fellow

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

OXFORD

UNIVERSITY PRESS

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford OX2 6DP

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford.
It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship,
and education by publishing worldwide in

Oxford New York

Auckland Cape Town Dar es Salaam Hong Kong Karachi
Kuala Lumpur Madrid Melbourne Mexico City Nairobi
New Delhi Shanghai Taipei Toronto

With offices in

Argentina Austria Brazil Chile Czech Republic France Greece
Guatemala Hungary Italy Japan Poland Portugal Singapore
South Korea Switzerland Thailand Turkey Ukraine Vietnam

Oxford is a registered trade mark of Oxford University Press
in the UK and in certain other countries

Published in the United States
by Oxford University Press Inc., New York

© Mark Hickford, 2011

The moral rights of the author have been asserted
Database right Oxford University Press (maker)

Crown copyright material is reproduced under class Licence Number C01P0000148
with the permission of OPSI and the Queen's Printer for Scotland

Contains public sector information licensed under the Open Government Licence v1.0
(<http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/open-government-licence.htm>)

Crown Copyright material reproduced with the permission of the Controller, HMSO
(under the terms of the Click Use licence)

First published 2011

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced,
stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means,
without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press,
or as expressly permitted by law, or under terms agreed with the appropriate
reprographics rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction
outside the scope of the above should be sent to the Rights Department,
Oxford University Press, at the address above

You must not circulate this book in any other binding or cover
and you must impose the same condition on any acquirer

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
Data available

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data
Library of Congress Control Number: 2011939972

Typeset by Newgen Imaging Systems (P) Ltd, Chennai, India
Printed in Great Britain
on acid-free paper by
CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY

ISBN 978-0-19-956865-9

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Table of Contents

<i>Preface and Acknowledgements</i>	vii
<i>List of Maps</i>	xiii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xv
<i>Key Māori Terms</i>	xvii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xix
<i>Table of Legislation and Bills</i>	xxi
1. Preliminaries	1
Overture—forging native title in an empire of variations, 1837 to 1862	1
Chapter outline	6
Three key ingredients—non-justiciability, conceptual incommensurability, or jurisdictional incommensurability: the pre-eminence of politics and political constitutionalism in the making of native title	10
The dynamism of native title—the politics of negotiability and the jurisprudence of empire	20
‘Lords of the Land’—mid-nineteenth-century New Zealand was not a place for ‘banal constitutionalism’	31
Unravelling and reframing Māori constitutional and political thought on territorial rights	37
2. An Empire of Variations: Problems of Settlement and the Property Rights of Indigenous Populations	40
Seeing native title through stadialism and <i>ius gentium</i> entwined	40
Trails of transmission to a particular colony and the relevance of empire	47
A New Zealand Association advocating ‘systematic colonization’	61
From Association to Company	82
A corporation acquiring territories	99
Several proclamations and a treaty	101
Conclusion: conversing with a corporation	107
3. Incredulity from a Distance: Disputing the Content of Indigenous Proprietary Entitlements, 1840 to 1844	110
Disciplining ‘adventurers without law’: the uses of <i>ius gentium</i> , 1840 to 1844	116
Unsettling intelligence, ‘disciplining moments’, and the extent of native title	139
Conclusion	162
4. ‘Vague Native Rights to Land’: Constitutionalism, Native Title, and Pursuing Settling Spaces, 1844–1853	164
Interrogating customs and sources of unease	175
Custom and its discontents, part I—Buller, Stanley, Hope, and Howick	180
Denouement: two Greys and the survival of ‘occupancy’, 1845–1853	193
Symonds contextualized	202

Placing the Treaty of Waitangi—native title and court decisions as a resource for colonial government disciplining subjects	203
Whither the Treaty of Waitangi? The conditionality of United States jurisprudence applied to New Zealand	207
Custom and its discontents, part II—Martin, Merivale, and the third Earl Grey	215
The Wesleyan Missionary Society, the incidents of native title, and living with abstract disagreement	221
The Aborigines' Protection Society—'magisterial jurisdiction' and 'territorial jurisdiction'	228
<i>Modus vivendi</i> and proprietary rights—the politics of negotiability and living with indeterminacy	230
New Zealand's lost whig foundations—diversity and balance in a 'baroque' constitution	234
Institutional pluralism, constitutional adjustment, and native title—constitutions as process and negotiability	235
Native title illuminating British political debates about colonial constitutional design	239
Conclusions	242
5. Extricating 'Native Title from its Present Entanglement'—Recognizing Diversity and the Problem of a Liberal Constitution	244
A jurisprudence in the shadows—balanced constitutions and native title	245
Jurisdictional incommensurability, conceptual incommensurability, and non-justiciability—the electoral franchise and native title	249
Jurisdictional incommensurability continued—a board of inquiry in 1856	267
'They are all entangled or matted together'	269
Constitutional condominium or consociation—reconceiving Crown-Māori relations in colonial New Zealand	273
This 'tendency to self-organization'—colonial administration looking for inroads, intersections, and uptake	276
The philosophy and political economy of individualizing native title through Crown grants—1856–1860	283
How to transform native title—indigenous communities as vectors of, and volunteers for, change	286
The necessity for courts to investigate native title—'Negotiations and diplomatism will have no force, and no public support'	298
State-building and experimentation—the Native Territorial Rights Bill and the 'exclusive use and occupancy of any lands'	300
'No well-defined law' to guide and 'exclusive use and occupancy'	303
Fashioning statutory windows of communicability between indigenous custom and English law	320
'How to reconcile this work of civilization with the fair claims and rights of the natives is the problem which the Government has to solve'	324
Conclusions	327

6. Exploring the Dynamics and Consequences of 'Occasional Association'	329
The metaphor and problem of 'occasional association'	329
'Occasional <i>negociation</i> ' and the metaphor of 'occasional association'—an extended essay in two parts	330
Part I—the Native Council Bill of 1860—an exceptional experiment in legislative design and imperial constitutionalism	334
Governing subjects as strangers and legislative design—double government, British South Asia, the Cape Colony, and New Zealand	353
Part II—the conditionality of the introduced colonial constitution—the revival and denouement of an imperial native council option	359
'The incorporation of the two races in one body politic'—letters patent and an imperial native council: native title, administering native districts, and the levers of imperial military assistance and funding	370
An imperial native council option confounded—the second cut	375
Conclusions—a study in failure	377
7. 'Tribunals Independent of a Prince', 1859–1862—Exploring the Dynamics and Consequences of 'Occasional Association', Part II	380
'Whatever may be the true theory of native tenure'—of native title, <i>mana</i> , and seignorial rights	380
Negotiations for the acquisition of the Pekaeka block in Waitara, 1859 and 1860	381
Warring memoranda—setting the scene	385
Indigenous orders, the conditionality of the introduced colonial constitution, and the three sticks of law, the divine being, and the <i>mana</i> of New Zealand in disunion	390
Constitutional reflections—living with indeterminacy and disagreement	405
Communal or tribal rights, political autonomy, and rights of government as a parochial and trans-oceanic theme—the political constitutionalism of native title, New Zealand, Algeria, and the law of nations	407
'It seems agreed that native title is marvellously complex'	419
Casting Waitara as a constitutional moment—Martin's <i>The Taranaki Question</i> and a beginning to the warring of pamphlets	419
'A country without law and a prince'—the Treaty as an usher for rights-talk; individual and collective rights	433
Who interprets?—'Tribunals independent of the prince' and the meanings of the Treaty of Waitangi	439
The Native Land Court, 1861–1862: a 'title sifted through' a statutory tribunal	444
8. Conclusions—Constitutional Design and the Treaty of Waitangi: Balanced Constitutions, Native Title, and the Normativity of Political Constitutionalism	450
<i>Bibliography</i>	463
<i>Index</i>	501