No Place for Fairness

Indigenous Land Rights and Policy in the Bear Island Case and Beyond

David T. McNab

McGILL-QUEEN'S UNIVERSITY PRESS Montreal & Kingston • London • Ithaca ©McGill-Queen's University Press 2009

ISBN 978-0-7735-3587-9 (cloth) ISBN 978-0-7735-3588-6 (paper)

Legal deposit fourth quarter 2009 Bibliothèque nationale du Québec

Printed in Canada on acid-free paper that is 100% ancient forest free (100% post-consumer recycled), processed chlorine free.

McGill-Queen's University Press acknowledges the support of the Canada Council for the Arts for our publishing program. We also acknowledge the financial support of the Government of Canada through the Book Publishing Industry Development Program (BPIDP) for our publishing activities.

Parts of chapter 2 were previously published in McNab, Circles of Time, 45-75; parts of chapter 5 appeared in McNab, Blockades and Resistance, 31-53, both published by Wilfrid Laurier University Press. They are reprinted here by permission.

Library and Archives Canada Cataloguing in Publication

McNab, David, 1947-

No place for fairness : indigenous land rights and policy in the Bear Island case and beyond / David T. McNab.

(McGill-Queen's Native and northern series; 58) Includes bibliographical references and index. ISBN 978-0-7735-3587-9 (bnd) ISBN 978-0-7735-3588-6 (pbk)

1. Native peoples-Ontario-Claims. 2. Native peoples-Land tenure-Ontario. 3. Native peoples-Ontario-Government relations. 4. Indian land transfers-Ontario. I. Title. II. Series: McGill-Queen's native and northern series; 58

E92.M36 2009 346.71304'3208997 C2009-902325-3

This book was designed and typeset by studio oneonone in Sabon 10.2/13.5

Contents

Preface / ix Introduction / 3

- 1. Meeting Places and Negotiations, 1763–1850s / 10
- 2 First Nations and British Imperial "Civilization" Policy in the Early Nineteenth Century / 20
- 3 Stories of Teme-Augama Anishnabai Land Rights and the Robinson Huron Treaty of 1850 and Its Aftermath / 39
- 4 "Don't fix it": Reflections on Ontario Aboriginal Policy and Processes, 1976–1984 / 55
 - 5 The Bear Island Trial, the Steele Judgement, and the First Settlement Offer, 1982–1986 / 75
- 6 Bear Island and Land Rights under a Liberal Majority, 1986–1988 / 90
 - 7 The Temagami Blockade of 1988 / 111

8 The 1989 Blockades and the 1990 Treaty of Co-Existence / 134
9 Oka and the Blockades in Northern Ontario, Summer 1990 / 152

10 Reflections since the 1990s / 168

Retrospect: Towards a Place for Fairness / 188

Acronyms / 193 Notes / 195 Bibliography / 221 Index / 233