

# Property Rights, Indigenous People and the Developing World

Issues from Aboriginal Entitlement  
to Intellectual Ownership Rights

*By*  
David Lea

MARTINUS  

---

NIJHOFF  

---

PUBLISHERS

LEIDEN • BOSTON  
2008

This book is printed on acid-free paper.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Lea, David, 1940-

Property rights, indigenous people and the developing world : issues from aboriginal entitlement to intellectual ownership rights / By David Lea.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-90-04-16694-3 (hardback : alk. paper) 1. Indigenous peoples--Legal status, laws, etc. 2. Right of property. 3. Land titles. 4. Intellectual property (International law) I. Title.

K3248.L36L43 2008

346.04'2--dc22

2008018215

ISBN: 978 90 04 16694 3

Copyright 2008 by Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, The Netherlands.  
Koninklijke Brill NV incorporates the imprints Brill, Hotei Publishing,  
IDC Publishers, Martinus Nijhoff Publishers and VSP.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use is granted by Koninklijke Brill NV provided that the appropriate fees are paid directly to The Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Suite 910, Danvers, MA 01923, USA.  
Fees are subject to change.

PRINTED IN THE NETHERLANDS

# Contents

Acknowledgement .....	ix
Introduction .....	1
Chapter One. Aboriginal Entitlement and Conservative Theory .....	13
Henry Reynolds and Aboriginal Title .....	16
James Tully and Amerindian Land Claims .....	18
Kymlicka and the Customary Context of Choice .....	23
‘Control Rights’ and ‘Income Rights’ .....	26
Conclusion .....	29
Chapter Two. Individual autonomy, Group self-determination and the Assimilation of Indigenous Cultures .....	31
Introduction .....	31
Protection and Empowerment of the Local Community .....	35
Aboriginal Empowerment and Incorporated Groups .....	38
Aggregates and Collectivities .....	43
Political Organization and Culture .....	47
Conclusion .....	48
Chapter Three. Shareholder Wealth Maximization, Multinational Corporations and the Developing World .....	51
Shareholder Wealth Maximization .....	53
The Justification of SWM .....	54
The Contractarian Legal Model and Shareholder Wealth Maximization .	56
Ethical and Legal Implications of Contractarian and Communitarian Theory .....	57
Stakeholder Theory .....	59
Economic Realities and Managerialism .....	62
Performativity Indexing .....	68
Agency theory and Managerial expertise .....	69
Chapter Four. Tully and de Soto on Uniformity and Diversity .....	77
James Tully and Modern Constitutionalism .....	78
De Soto and the Mystery of Capitalism .....	81
Differences Between Western and Customary Ownership in Melanesia and Elsewhere .....	83

Differing Concepts of Ownership and the Transformation of Traditional Cultures .....	87
Conclusion .....	91
Chapter Five. Customary Land Tenure and Communal Holdings .....	95
The Communal Nature of Customary Land Tenure .....	97
The Nature of Customary Land Tenure .....	100
Forests and Pastures .....	103
Agricultural Land .....	105
Advantages and disadvantages of Western forms of Private Ownership ...	108
Control and Income Ownership .....	111
The Relation Between Income Rights and Future Development .....	112
Voluntary Association and Development .....	113
Enclosure and the issue of Individuating and defining Income Rights....	115
Purchase and Sale of Land .....	117
Chapter Six. Custom as Law .....	121
Legal versus Customary Property rights .....	128
Summary .....	130
Chapter Seven. Papua New Guinea and the Legal Methods for	
Maintaining Customary Land Tenure .....	131
The Bougainville Crisis .....	132
The Southern Highlands .....	135
The Forestry Sector .....	142
Possible Solution .....	149
Conclusion .....	152
Chapter Eight. Customary Land Tenure in Fiji: A Questionable Colonial	
Legacy .....	153
Jamestown and Plymouth .....	153
Contrasts with events in Fiji .....	155
Later Developments in Fijian Land Tenure .....	158
Fiji Today .....	159
Conclusion .....	164
Chapter Nine. The Expansion and Restructuring of Intellectual Property	
and Its Implications for the Developing World .....	167
Western Formal Property .....	167
IP as Income Rights .....	170
Global Implications .....	182

Taxation as slavery .....	193
Conclusion .....	195
Chapter Ten. The Myth of Free Markets: Intellectual Property, the IT	
Industry, and Market Freedoms in the Global Arena .....	201
Intellectual Property Rights and Stallman's Criticisms .....	207
Intellectual Property and market freedom .....	211
The Global Arena .....	213
Summary .....	216
Conclusion .....	217
Chapter Eleven. From the Wright Brothers to Microsoft: Issues in the	
Moral Grounding of Intellectual Property Rights .....	219
Locke's Theory of the Moral Basis of Property .....	222
Control and Income Ownership .....	225
Monopolistic Control of Products and Income .....	226
Microsoft and Market Dominance .....	231
Conclusion .....	237
Appendix .....	240
Chapter Twelve. A Delicate Balance: The Right to Health Care, IP Rights	
in Pharmaceuticals and TRIPS Compliance .....	241
The Fairness Argument .....	242
IP Rights and Innovation .....	243
Countervailing Moral Arguments .....	244
Shared Responsibilities .....	246
Pharma Lobbying, legal challenges and the TRIPS Agreement .....	248
Determining the Effect of the Implementation of the TRIPS Agreement	
in India .....	253
Conclusion .....	255
Chapter Thirteen. Rights and Genetic Material in Agriculture and Human	
Research: Two forms of Biopiracy? .....	261
Agribusiness and the Patenting of Genetic material .....	262
The expansion of IP rights, the TRIPS Agreement and Farmers' Rights..	265
The Effect of IP on Agricultural Research .....	269
Intellectual property and the Human Genome .....	273
Conclusion .....	275
Bibliography .....	281
Index .....	293