

RACIALIZED POLICING

ABORIGINAL PEOPLE'S ENCOUNTERS WITH THE POLICE

ELIZABETH COMACK

FERNWOOD PUBLISHING ■ HALIFAX & WINNIPEG

Copyright © 2012 Elizabeth Comack

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced or transmitted in any form by any means without permission in writing from the publisher, except by a reviewer, who may quote brief passages in a review.

Editing: Robert Clarke

Cover art: Jackie Traverse

Cover design: John van der Woude

Printed and bound in Canada by Hignell Book Printing



Published in Canada by Fernwood Publishing
32 Oceanvista Lane, Black Point, Nova Scotia, B0J 1B0
and 748 Broadway Avenue, Winnipeg, Manitoba, R3G 0X3
www.fernwoodpublishing.ca

Fernwood Publishing Company Limited gratefully acknowledges the financial support of the Government of Canada through the Canada Book Fund and the Canada Council for the Arts, the Nova Scotia Department of Communities, Culture and Heritage, the Manitoba Arts Council, the Manitoba Department of Culture, Heritage and Tourism under the Manitoba Publishers Marketing Assistance Program and the Province of Manitoba, through the Book Publishing Tax Credit, for our publishing program.



Library and Archives Canada Cataloguing in Publication

Comack, Elizabeth, 1952-
Racialized policing : aboriginal people's encounters with
the police / Elizabeth Comack.

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN 978-1-55266-475-9

1. Racial profiling in law enforcement--Canada.
2. Police-community relations--Canada. 3. Native
peoples--Canada. 4. Police--Canada. 5. Racism--Canada.

I. Title.

HV7936.R3C66 2012 363.2'30897071 C2011-908400-7

CONTENTS

FOREWORD.....	9
PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	10
1. RACE AND RACISM	13
<i>Understanding Race and Racialization</i>	16
<i>Racism and Othering</i>	18
<i>Everyday Racism</i>	19
<i>Racial Formation</i>	20
<i>Racialization and Policing</i>	23
2. RACIAL PROFILING VERSUS RACIALIZED POLICING	27
<i>Government Inquiries</i>	28
<i>Systemic Racism and Racialization</i>	30
<i>The Commission's Findings</i>	31
<i>Police Stops: Use of Discretionary Power</i>	32
<i>Perceived Fairness of Police Stops</i>	33
<i>The Exercise of Discretionary Power</i>	34
<i>The Toronto Star Articles</i>	35
<i>A Firestorm of Controversy</i>	36
<i>Criminologists Weigh In</i>	41
<i>Experiences of Racial Profiling</i>	45
<i>Mere "Anecdotes"?</i>	47
<i>The Kingston Study</i>	50
<i>The Toronto Star Redux</i>	53
<i>From Racial Profiling to Racialized Policing</i>	56
<i>Policing and the Reproduction of Order</i>	57
<i>The Culture of Policing</i>	60
<i>Racialized Spaces</i>	62
<i>Moving Forward</i>	64

3. COLONIALISM PAST AND PRESENT	66
<i>Colonialism Past.....</i>	<i>69</i>
<i>The North West Mounted Police.....</i>	<i>74</i>
<i>Colonialism Present.....</i>	<i>79</i>
<i>Social Exclusion and Poverty.....</i>	<i>79</i>
<i>Violence and Alcohol Use.....</i>	<i>82</i>
<i>Overrepresentation in the Criminal Justice System.....</i>	<i>84</i>
<i>The Production of "Crime".....</i>	<i>87</i>
 4. THE SHOOTING OF J.J. HARPER	 89
<i>The Sequence of Events.....</i>	<i>90</i>
<i>The Inquest</i>	<i>92</i>
<i>Competing Truth Claims</i>	<i>92</i>
<i>Constructing the Key Players</i>	<i>93</i>
<i>The Inquest Report.....</i>	<i>94</i>
<i>The Aboriginal Justice Inquiry.....</i>	<i>95</i>
<i>The Encounter.....</i>	<i>95</i>
<i>The Shooting.....</i>	<i>97</i>
<i>The Issue of Witness Credibility.....</i>	<i>98</i>
<i>The Investigation</i>	<i>99</i>
<i>The Blue Wall.....</i>	<i>101</i>
<i>The Taser Death of Robert Dziekanski.....</i>	<i>106</i>
<i>Race and Racism in the Harper Case.....</i>	<i>108</i>
<i>Collateral Damage.....</i>	<i>112</i>
 5. STARLIGHT TOURS	 115
<i>Darrel Night's Starlight Tour.....</i>	<i>117</i>
<i>The Freezing Deaths of Rodney Nastius and Lawrence Wegner.....</i>	<i>120</i>
<i>The Trial of Constables Hatches and Munson.....</i>	<i>123</i>
<i>The Hatches and Munson Appeal.....</i>	<i>126</i>
<i>The Freezing Death of Neil Stonechild</i>	<i>132</i>
<i>The RCMP Investigation into Stonechild's Death.....</i>	<i>134</i>
<i>The Wright Commission.....</i>	<i>138</i>
<i>Unrest within the Saskatoon Police Service.....</i>	<i>141</i>
<i>Competing Truths about Starlight Tours.....</i>	<i>142</i>
<i>The Death of Frank Joseph Paul.....</i>	<i>146</i>
<i>Making Sense of Starlight Tours.....</i>	<i>149</i>

6. POLICING WINNIPEG'S INNER-CITY COMMUNITIES	152
<i>Racialized Poverty, Crime, and Violence in the Inner City.....</i>	<i>153</i>
<i>Models of Policing in Winnipeg.....</i>	<i>156</i>
<i>The Experiences and Standpoints of Aboriginal People.....</i>	<i>160</i>
<i>The "Usual Suspects"</i>	<i>162</i>
<i>Racialized and Sexualized Frames</i>	<i>167</i>
<i>The Use of Racist and Sexist Language.....</i>	<i>171</i>
<i>Troublesome Police Practices.....</i>	<i>174</i>
<i>"A Problem of Considerable Magnitude"</i>	<i>186</i>
 7. THE SHOOTING OF MATTHEW DUMAS	 192
<i>The Dumas Inquest.....</i>	<i>196</i>
<i>The Inquest Testimonies.....</i>	<i>197</i>
<i>"An Unexpected Tragedy"</i>	<i>204</i>
<i>"Race Had Nothing to Do with This"</i>	<i>206</i>
<i>Unpacking the Official Version.....</i>	<i>207</i>
<i>Racialized Policing in the Dumas Case.....</i>	<i>210</i>
<i>Mundane Processes</i>	<i>210</i>
<i>"An Indian Boy in the North End"</i>	<i>214</i>
<i>Tragic—but Not Unexpected.....</i>	<i>217</i>
 8. RACIALIZED POLICING AND REPRODUCING ORDER.....	 219
<i>The Denial of a Fundamental Problem</i>	<i>220</i>
<i>What Is to Be Done?.....</i>	<i>224</i>
<i>ReFraming the Problem.....</i>	<i>231</i>
<i>Community Mobilization</i>	<i>233</i>
 APPENDIX: A NOTE ON METHODOLOGY.....	 235
REFERENCES.....	237