

Canadian Institute
of Resources Law
Institut canadien du
droit des ressources

**RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT AND ABORIGINAL
LAND RIGHTS**

**Richard H. Bartlett
Chair of Natural Resources Law
Faculty of Law
The University of Calgary**

September 1991

Canadian Cataloguing in Publication Data

Bartlett, Richard H., 1947-

Resource development and aboriginal land rights

ISBN 0-919269-33-8

1. Indians of North America—Canada, Western—Land tenure. 2. Indians of North America—Canada, Western—Land transfer. 3. Indians of North America—Canada, Western—Claims. 4. Natural resources—Law and legislation—Canada, Western. 5. Natural resources—Government policy—Canada, Western. I. Canadian Institute of Resources Law. II. Title.

KE7739.L3B37 1991 346.71204'32'08997

C91-091655-1

© 1991 by Canadian Institute of Resources Law
The University of Calgary
All Rights Reserved
Printed in Canada

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Foreword / i

Avant-Propos / iii

Preface / v

Préface / vii

Resource Development and Aboriginal Title in Canada / 1

**Resource Development and Treaty Land Entitlement
in Western Canada / 39**

Appendix

**Treaty Land Entitlement: The Treaty Clauses Providing
for Establishment of Reserves / 113**

Institute Publications / 120

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Aboriginal Title and Resource Development / 1

**The Source of Title of the Crown, Resource Developers,
and the Aboriginal Peoples — What Principle, If Any? / 1**

**The Content of Aboriginal Title: Does It Include
the Right to Develop Resources? Complete Ownership
or Traditional Uses Only? / 5**

**The Dominant Title: The Resource Developer or the
Aboriginal People? / 12**

**The Dominance Challenged — Constitutional Limitations
on the Extinguishment of Aboriginal Title / 26**

**Implications for Resource Development — Settling
Aboriginal Title and the Validity of Resource
Dispositions / 29**

Conclusion / 35

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. **Introduction / 39**
2. **Resource Development Was the Object in Treating With the Indians /40**
3. **The Conditions Upon Which Resource Development Might Proceed: The Terms of the Treaties / 45**
 - Precious Metals: Gold and Silver / 48
 - Water / 50
4. **Requiring the Provinces to Fulfill The Conditions: The Natural Resources Transfer Agreements with Alberta, Saskatchewan, and Manitoba / 53**
 - The Need for a Constitutional Provision / 53
 - The Nature of the Constitutional Obligation / 55
 - The Lands Subject to Selection / 56
 - Unoccupied Crown Lands / 56
 - Mines and Forests / 60
 - Water / 65
 - Saskatchewan / 67
 - Manitoba / 69
 - Alberta / 71
 - The Size of the Area Required to be Set Aside / 71
 - Partial Treaty Land Entitlement / 76
 - Bill C-31 / 84
 - Cash in Lieu / 84
 - Existing Interests / 84
5. **British Columbia / 91**
6. **The Validity of Resource Dispositions and the Enforcement of Treaty Land Entitlement / 95**
 - Analogous to a Contract / 95
 - Breach of Fiduciary Obligation / 97
 - Validity of Resource Dispositions / 100
7. **A Cloud on the Title / 108**

**8. A 1991 Postscript: Delgamuukw and Bear
Island Foundation / 109**