

# KEEPING THE LAND

## KITCHENUHMAYKOOSIB INNINUWUG, RECONCILIATION AND CANADIAN LAW

Rachel Ariss  
with John Cutfeet

Fernwood Publishing • Halifax & Winnipeg

## FOR MY FAMILY

Copyright © 2012 Rachel Ariss, John Cutfeet

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced or transmitted in any form by any means without permission in writing from the publisher, except by a reviewer, who may quote brief passages in a review.

Editing: Sarah Michaelson  
Cover design: John van der Woude  
Printed and bound in Canada by Hignell Book Printing



Published in Canada by Fernwood Publishing  
32 Oceanvista Lane, Black Point, Nova Scotia, B0J 1B0  
and 748 Broadway Avenue, Winnipeg, Manitoba, R3G 0X3  
[www.fernwoodpublishing.ca](http://www.fernwoodpublishing.ca)

Fernwood Publishing Company Limited gratefully acknowledges the financial support of the Government of Canada through the Canada Book Fund and the Canada Council for the Arts, the Nova Scotia Department of Communities, Culture and Heritage, the Manitoba Department of Culture, Heritage and Tourism under the Manitoba Publishers Marketing Assistance Program and the Province of Manitoba, through the Book Publishing Tax Credit, for our publishing program.



Canadian  
Heritage

Patrimoine  
canadien



Le Conseil canadien des arts  
Le Conseil des Arts du Canada



NOVA SCOTIA

Manitoba



Library and Archives Canada Cataloguing in Publication

Ariss, Rachel, 1965-  
Keeping the land : Kitchenuhmaykoosib Inninuwug,  
reconciliation and Canadian law / Rachel Ariss.

Includes bibliographical references.  
ISBN 978-1-55266-477-3

1. Indians of North America--Land tenure--Ontario,  
Northern. 2. Indians of North America--Legal status, laws,  
etc.--Ontario, Northern. 3. Kitchenuhmaykoosib Inninuwug  
First Nation. 4. Platinum mines and mining--Ontario, Northern.  
I. Kitchenuhmaykoosib Inninuwug First Nation II. Title.

E98.L3A73 2012

323.1197323

C2011-908402-3

# CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.....	5
1. <i>PLATINEX V. KITCHENUH MAYKOOSIB INNINUWUG</i> .....	7
Changing Contexts of Aboriginal Rights .....	9
Aboriginal Land Rights Since the 1970s.....	12
Changing Social Conditions.....	13
Continuing Aboriginal Protest and Rights Activism .....	14
2. LAND AND COMMUNITY, LAW AND MINING IN NORTHERN ONTARIO .....	17
With co-author John Cutfeet	
Land and Community.....	17
Treaty Nine .....	23
Crown Lands, Reserve Lands and the Treaty Land Entitlement Claim.....	28
The Infringement of Treaty Rights and the Duty to Consult.....	31
Ontario's <i>Mining Act</i> .....	37
Conclusion: Canadian Law on Kitchenuhmaykoosib Inninuwig Traditional Territory .....	39
3. THREE LAWS CONVERGE ON THIS PLACE KANAWAYANDAN D'AAKI AND INDIGENOUS LAW .....	41
With co-author John Cutfeet	
<i>Kanawayandan D'aaki</i> .....	43
Traditional Territory in Kitchenuhmaykoosib Inninuwig .....	48
Indigenous Jurisprudence and Canadian Law.....	51
Conclusion: <i>Kanawayandan D'aaki</i> , Canadian Law and Land .....	62
4. RESISTANCE, LAW AND COMMUNITY ORGANIZING.....	65
Law, Social Change, Social Control and Social Norms .....	65
First Nations Communities' Protection of Traditional Territory .....	67
Platinex's Recourse to the Courts.....	73
<i>Platinex v. Kitchenuhmaykoosib Inninuwig</i> , July 2006 .....	75
Ontario's Intervention .....	77
<i>Platinex v. Kitchenuhmaykoosib Inninuwig</i> , May 2007 .....	78
Kitchenuhmaykoosib Inninuwig and the Ardoch Algonquin First Nation .....	79
Kitchenuhmaykoosib Inninuwig Continues to Protect the Land.....	80
Kitchenuhmaykoosib Inninuwig Leadership Found in Contempt of Court ...	83
Community Activism – Supporting the KI Six.....	89
<i>Platinex v. Kitchenuhmaykoosib Inninuwig</i> , May 2008.....	94
Conclusion: Law and Social Change.....	96

5. LAW, LEGAL PROCESS AND RECONCILIATION IN <i>PLATINEX V. KITCHENUHMAYKOOSIB INNINUWUG</i> .....	100
Irreparable Harm and KI's Attachment to the Land.....	100
Consultation Towards Mining.....	103
Ontario's Intervention and the Scope of the Duty to Consult.....	104
Lifting the Injunction and Imposing an Agreement.....	106
Sentencing the KI Leadership for Contempt of Court.....	113
Freeing Bob Lovelace and the KI Six: The Ontario Court of Appeal.....	116
Conclusion: Reconciliation and Law in <i>Platinex v. Kitchenuhmaykoosib Inninuwig</i> .....	118
6. RECONCILIATION.....	121
Canadian Courts: Contributions to Reconciliation.....	122
Reconciliation: The Significance of Court Recognition of Indigenous Legal Traditions.....	124
Canadian Courts: Detractions from Reconciliation.....	126
Reconciliation and Cultural Difference.....	130
The Duty to Consult and Accommodate and the Honour of the Crown....	132
Guidance for Reconciliation in Treaties.....	135
Indigenous Traditional Law in Reconciliation: Beyond Canadian Law.....	137
Understanding Aboriginal Rights Claims Through the Lens of Reconciliation.....	142
Emergence of Social Reconciliation.....	144
Conclusion: The Role of Indigenous Law in Reconciliation.....	146
7. IMPASSE AND CHANGE.....	149
Ending <i>Platinex v. KI</i> .....	149
<i>Mining Act</i> Amendments.....	150
Current Mining Practice in Northern Ontario: More of the Same.....	155
Reconciliation: Recognition, Imagination and Legal Change.....	156
EPILOGUE: OCTOBER 2010.....	162
REFERENCES.....	165